

BOARD OF TRUSTEES AUDIT SUBCOMMITTEE Michael A. Peterson, Chair Molly S. Seals, Vice Chair Anita A. Hackstedde James E. "Ted" Roberts Rocco L. Core

Wednesday, September 4, 2019 2:00 p.m. or immediately following previous meeting **Kilcawley Center President's Suites** 

#### **AGENDA**

- A. Disposition of Minutes for Meeting Held June 6, 2019
- B. Old Business
- C. Committee Items
  - 1. Discussion Items
- Tab C.1.a.
- a. Audit Matrix Open Audit Recommendations Update
  This matrix tracks the progress of the implementation of recommendations for improvement or correction made by internal and external auditors.
  Kelli Miller, Director of Internal Audit, will report.
- b. Anonymous Reporting Hotline Stats Update
  Kelli Miller, Director of Internal Audit, will report.
- c. Enterprise Risk Management Update
  Kelli Miller, Director of Internal Audit, will report.
- 2. Action Item
- Tab C.2.a.
- a. Resolution to Approve FY20 Proposed Internal Audit Plan and Risk Assessment Kelli Miller, Director of Internal Audit, will report.
- D. New Business
- E. Adjournment

### **AUDIT RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS - FY2020 Q1**

Date Issued

Risk Category Risk Level Original Deadline

Revised Deadline

Current Status

Tracking Faculty Workload

Feb. 2015

Academic Affairs low

Academic Affairs

12/31/2016 7/31/2020

DEADLINE REVISED

Summary of Recommendation

Summary of Response

**Current Status Comment** 

**Prior Status Comment** 

2015-03-02

if the Banner System has the capability to calculate and track teaching hours, non-teaching time, and total faculty PT Academic Processes workload, and if the system does, then the use of the system

should be implemented.

We recommend that further research be done to determine

Banner has the ability to monitor faculty workload, and there is faculty workload non-teaching capability. A more detailed analysis of Banner system capabilities should be completed. The academic division is currently working with the Registrar's office to implement a scheduling and registration system; this system will make much of the data available at an earlier time and improve tracking and reporting processes.

Analysis of Banner system has been completed. Banner Faculty Load and Compensation (FLAC) module is currently being implemented. Scheduled for testing in Spring 2020.

2018-02-01 Conflict of interest in research

Research Compliance Audit

2/11/19

research High

Academic Affairs

7/31/2020

ON SCHEDULE

Develop and communicate procedures to ensure potential conflicts are timely and completely identified, disclosed, documented and reviewed in accordance with University Policy 3356-10-17 Objectivity in Research - Avoidance of Conflicts of Interest.

Management recognizes conflict of interest (Col), whether real or apparent, represents one of the greatest potential liabilities to the University. It is proposed that all Principal Investigators must have a Col declaration on file with the Research Office before being allowed to seek external support for scholarly activity or research.

2018-02-02 Post award changes and rebudgets

Research Compliance Audit

2/11/19

research High

Academic Affairs

8/31/2019 CLOSED Develop and implement a formal, documented internal preapproval process for post award changes and rebudgets to ensure sponsor pre-approval is timely obtained.

Corrective actions include:

currently PI's have the ability to process budget transfers within their grant fund in Banner. The Controller's Office is exploring limiting system ability for PI's to process budget transfers:

development of an internally routed form in which transfers are requested by PI and submitted through an approval process, to ORS and ending with Grants Accounting; incorporation of these requirements into appropriate documentation and training.

Internal Audit obtained and reviewed correspondence issued to PIs/Financial Managers which mandated new procedures related to post award changes and rebudgets. These procedures address timely pre-approval of changes. IA believes Corrective Action has been implemented. Recommendation Closed Q1 FY 20.

Wednesday, August 21, 2019

research Moderate Academic Affairs 8/31/2020

Audit Recommendation Number / Name Audit	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Current Status Comment	Prior Status Comment
Date Issued Risk Category				
Risk Level				
Division				
Original Deadline Revised Deadline				
Current Status				
2018-02-07 Research Office supporting documentation	Develop procedures to ensure documentation is retained in accordance with the university's record retention schedule	Adherence to established procedures can be assured by implementation of:		
Research Compliance Audit	and Office of Research procedures.	a regular review of existing documents with a view to		
2/11/19		resolving inconsistencies and completing the record; assignment of primary responsibility for record retention,		
research		archiving and destruction to a designated officer.		
Low				
Academic Affairs 1/31/2020				
ON SCHEDULE				
ON SCHEDULE				
2018-02-08 Monitoring nonfinancial	Develop a process to track and monitor programmatic reporting to comply with Office of Research procedures	Appropriately configured eRA system will allow convenient	Management Response Summary modified slightly based on	
programmatic reporting	ensuring timely submission of reports.	tracking of reporting requirements and responses. Prior to such acquisition, ORS will follow-up on the reporting	analysis performed by new Director of Research Compliance and Initiatives.	
Research Compliance Audit 2/11/19		notifications the PI and ORS review from federal funding	Implementation date delayed to align this task with overall	
		agencies.	project review and implementation.	
research				
Low				
Academic Affairs				
3/31/2019 <b>7/31/2020</b>				
DEADLINE REVISED				
2018-02-09 Cost transfer standardization	Develop standard procedures for requesting cost transfers to	New forms are being developed that will provide consistency	Internal Audit obtained and reviewed correspondence	
	ensure consistent documentation of approval and iustification.	for all types of cost transfer requests that will include an	issued to Pls/Financial Managers which mandated new	
Research Compliance Audit	justification.	explanation, justification, and appropriate approvals.	procedures related to cost transfers. These procedures result in documentation supporting approval and justification	
2/11/19			for cost transers. IA believes Corrective Action has been	
Financial			implemented. Recommendation Closed Q1 FY 20.	
Low				
Finance and Business Operations				
7/1/2019				
CLOSED				
2018-02-10 Pre-approval of travel expenses	Include Grants Accounting in the Concur automated approval workflow routing for expenses charged to grant funds.	and the second second second to account		
charged to grants	worknow routing for expenses charged to grant funds.	workflow approvals in Concur rather than relying on manual routing. We are exploring the use of automated workflows		
Research Compliance Audit /11/19		for travel reimbursements in Concur.		
inancial ow				
w				
nance and Business Operations				
/1/2020				

ON SCHEDULE

Audit Recommer Audit Date Issued	dation Number / Name	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Current Status Comment	Prior Status Comment
Risk Category Risk Level					
Division					
Original Deadline	Revised Deadline				
Current St	atus de la companya				
	Electronic research administration system mpliance Audit	Develop a formal implementation plan for the ERA system software to enable appropriate oversight and management of the project.	A viable eRA system was identified and purchased. However, the vendor went out of business, rendering the selected platform impractical. The Office of Research has begun the process of evaluating alternative systems and a potential eRA system has been identified, The procurement of the system is expected in 1st quarter 2020 and implementation will follow.	Management Response Summary modified slightly based on analysis performed by new Director of Research Compliance and Initiatives.	
7/31/2020					
ON SCHEDUL	E				
ON SCHEDUL					



#### RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE FY20 ANNUAL INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN

WHEREAS, the Annual Internal Audit Plan contains the planned scope and time budget of audit engagements for the fiscal year; and

WHEREAS, Internal Audit assesses risk annually and focuses priorities of the Annual Internal Audit Plan on risk exposures throughout the University; and

WHEREAS, the risk-based Annual Internal Audit Plan for fiscal year 2020 has been developed; and

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED,** that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University does hereby approve the FY20 Annual Internal Audit Plan, as shown in Exhibit \_\_ and made part hereof.

# Youngstown State University Office of Internal Audit FY 2019 Audit Plan Approved June 7, 2018

Jul - Sept Oct - Dec Jan - Mar Apr - Jun

Total Hours	585	680	680	585	2530
		L	<u> </u>		
	170			120	570
Holiday, Vacation/Sick	80	<u>30</u>	40	<u>20</u>	<u>170</u>
Professional Development & Training	10	10	10	10	40
Enterprise Risk Management assistance	20	20	20	20	80
Audit Risk Assessment, Annual Planning, Audit Subcommitte Prep and Meetings	15	15	15	25	70
Administrative (includes student auditor hiring, training)	45	60	60	45	210
Administrative & Planning:					
Advisory (added FY18Q3)	90	90	90	90	300
Advisory (added EV1902)	00	90	90	90	360
	325	455	445	375	1600
Hotline Monitoring	15	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	<u>60</u>
Open Audit Recommendation Follow-up	35	35	35	35	140
Continuous Auditing/Analytics	120		155	120	550
Audit engagements	155	250	240	205	850
Audit and Assurance: (see Proposed Audit Plan for detail)					
	Q1 Total	Q2 Total	Q3 Total	Q4 Total	Total
					FY19
	Jul Jupe	OCC DCC	Jail - Ivial	, .p	

### Youngstown State University Office of Internal Audit FY 2020 Audit Plan and Risk Assessment Proposed September 2019

			Audit Engagen	nents			
Area / Quarter Planned	Last Audited	Project Scope	Risk	Risk Category	Preliminary Risk Assessment	Audit Objective	FY20 Budgeted Hours
Student Organizations 1st quarter (carryover from FY19)	n/a	operational and financial controls related to registered student organizations	noncompliance with policies and procedures; inadequate and/or ineffectiveness of operational and financial controls	Financial	Moderate	identify, assess, and test processes to ensure compliance with policies and procedures, and design and effectiveness of financial and operational controls including adequacy of policy and procedures	70
Student Billing and Accounts Receivable 2nd quarter	2013	policies, procedures and controls related to student billing and student accounts receivable including billing, receiving, posting, and deposting student payments and collection efforts on past due accounts	tuition and fees charged are incorrect; manual adjustments are in error, unsupported or not authorized; student payments are applied incorrectly or not in a timely manner; past due accounts inadequately managed; student write offs do not comply with policies and procedures; allowance is not established, inadequate or not reviewed for reasonableness; lack of segregation of duties in billing, payment collection and a/r process	Financial	High	identify, assess, and test processes and selected transactions to ensure compliance with policies and procedures, overall efficiency and effectiveness of internal control and related procedures and evaluation of segregation of duties	17
Banner User Access 3rd quarter (carryover from 2019)	2016	procedures and controls for granting, modifying, and terminating Banner access within Banner modules	inappropriate Banner user access is inherently high risk in complex ERP system with a large number of users	ІТ	High	ensure Banner user access is appropriately assigned and restricted based on least privilege (users have access only to what is required to perform their duties) including read-only access to sensitive and confidential information, and maintains segregation of duties	28
Donor Restricted Funds	2009	policies, procedures and controls related to acceptance, receipt, documentation and use of donor restricted funds in accordance with donor intent	compliance, financial, reputational and governance risks resulting from improper understanding, documentation, and use of funds in accordance with donor intent	Financial	Moderate	identify, assess and test processes and selected transactions to ensure compliance with policies and procedures and overall effectiveness of internal control related to acceptance, tracking and use of donor restricted funds	17

Total Audit Engagements

693

Area	Last audited	Project Scope	Risk	Risk Category	Preliminary Risk Assessment	Audit Objective	FY20 Budgeted Hours
ontinuous Auditing - ayroll	ongoing	quarterly continuous auditing	fraud and errors related to payroll	Financial		analysis of quarterly payroll data to ensure operating effectiveness of internal controls	25:
ontinuous Auditing - ccounts Payable	ongoing	quarterly continuous auditing	fraud and errors related to payables	Financial		analysis of quarterly payables data to ensure operating effectiveness of internal controls	299

	a de la company		Open Audit Recommenda	ition Follow-up	im Carrier		NASTURAL
Area		Project Scope	Risk	Risk Category	Preliminary Risk Assessment	Audit Objective	FY20 Budgeted Hours
Open Audit Recommendation Follow-up	IODEOIDE	Follow-up on open audit recommendations from previous audits	various	various	I .	assess implementation of appropriate corrective action to address audit recommendations	140
						Total Open Audit Recommendation Follow-up	140

			Hotline Mon	itoring		**	
Area		Project Scope	Risk	Risk Category	Preliminary Risk Assessment	Audit Objective	FY20 Budgeted Hours
Hotline Monitoring	ongoing	Ongoing monitoring of hotline reports	fraud/unethical conduct	various	!	assess risk level and quality of hotline reports; ensure timely follow-up of reports as deemed necessary	60
				<del>- /- ··· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·</del>		Total Hotline Monitoring	<u>60</u>

Audit Plan Total

<u>1443</u>

# Youngstown State University Office of Internal Audit FY 2020 Audit Plan Proposed September 2019

Jul - Sept Oct - Dec Jan - Mar Apr - Jun

	Jui - Sept	Oct - Dec	Jail - Iviai	Abi - Juli	
					FY20
	Q1 Total	Q2 Total	Q3 Total	Q4 Total	Total
Audit and Assurance: (see Proposed Audit Plan for detail)					
Audit engagements	82	129	326	156	693
Continuous Auditing/Analytics	120	155	155	120	550
Open Audit Recommendation Follow-up	35	35	35	35	140
Hotline Monitoring	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	<u>15</u>	60
	252	334	531		1443
Advisory	90	90	90	90	360
Administrative & Planning:					
Administrative (includes student auditor hiring, training)	45	60	60	45	210
Audit Risk Assessment, Annual Planning, Audit Subcommitte Prep and Meetings	15	15	15	25	70
Enterprise Risk Management assistance	20	20	20	20	80
Professional Development & Training	10	10	10	10	40
Holiday, Vacation/Sick	44	<u>52</u>	<u>20</u>	<u>20</u>	136
	134		125		536
	·				
Total Hours	476	581	746	536	2339

Note: hours above include a total of 675 hours for a student audit intern in Fall 2019 and two student audit interns in the Spring 2020

#### YSU FY 2020 Internal Audit Risk Assessment

#### Facilities 100

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
FAC 101	Special Events, Facility Use	4	3	4	2	2	3	2		1	3	26	275
FAC102	Maintenance- Buildings/Grounds	4	4	4	2	3	4	3	:	1	2.25	30.25	307.5
FAC 103	Building Access/ Key Control	4	2	3	2	2	2	2	-	1	2.25	21.25	227.5
FAC 104	Capital Project Management	3	4	4	4	4	3	4	4	1	1.5	32.5	310
Fac 105	Government Compliance	4	3	4	4	4	3	2		1	3	31	310

#### Financial 200

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
FIN 201	Grants:	1	1									245	220
1114 201	Accounting/Management	1	1	4	4	4	4	1	1	4	1.5	34.5	330
FIN 202	YSU Foundation	1	. 5	5	4	4	2	2		3 1	3	30	305
FIN 203	Budget Management	1	. 5	5	5	5	5	4		5 4	2	41	390
FIN 204	Procurement, Contracts	1	. 5	4	4	3	5	3		3 3	1.5	32.5	315
FIN 205	Financial Aid	1	. 5	5	5	5	5	4		4 5	0.5	39.5	385
FIN 206	Collections - Receivables	1	. 5	5	5	3	5	4		4 5	2.25	39.25	382.5
FIN 207	Payroll	3	5	5	5	5	5	4		4 5	1.5	42.5	425
FIN 208	Disbursements, A/P	1	. 5	4	4	4	5	4		4 5	1.5	37.5	365

#### Research 300

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
RES 301	Grant Management	1	4	5	5	5	4		5	5 3	1.5	38.5	355
RES 302	Human/Animal Subjects	5	5	5	5	4	3		3	3 3	0.5	36.5	385
RES 303	Intellectual Property	1	4	4	. 5	5	3		1	4 3	2.25	35.25	332.5
RES 304	External Partnerships	1	4	4	5	5	3	4	1	4 3	4	37	350
RES 305	Research Funding	1	5	5	5	5	4		4	4 4	2.25	39.25	382.5
Res 306	3D Printing	5	4	4	4	4	3		1	4 3	5	40	405

#### YSU FY 2020 Internal Audit Risk Assessment

#### **Human Resources 400**

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
	E THE SET STREET	15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
HR 401	Discrimination, Harassment	4	4	5	4	4	4	3		4 2	5	39	390
HR 402	Employee Travel	4	3	3	3	1	3	2		2 1	2.5	24.5	250
HR 403	Volunteers	4	1	4	2	1	1	1		1 1	1.5	17.5	A STREET, SQUARE, SQUA
HR 404	Employee Productivity	4	4	3	4	3	4	1		4 3	2	32	
HR 405	Succession Planning	3	5	5	4	5	4	4		3 1	5	39	
HR 406	Employment Practices, Termination	4	5	4	4	4	3	2		4 3	3.75	36.75	382.5
HR 407	Employment Practices, Hiring	4	4	4	4	4	4	2		3 3	1.5	33.5	345
										1			

#### Athletics 500

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
ATH 501	Team Travel	4	3	3	3	2	2	1		1 1	2.25	22.25	242.5
ATH 502	Camps -Athletic	5	5	4	4	3	2	1		1 2	3	30	340
ATH 503	NCAA Compliance	3	5	4	5	4	2	2		2 2	1.5	30.5	320
ATH 504	Athletic Injury	5	5	4	4	3	2	2		2 2	3	32	350

#### Safety 600

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
A STATE OF THE STATE OF		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
SAF 601	Campus Safety -Crisis Management	5	3	4	3	4	4	3		3 2	5	36	365
SAF 602	Environmental Compliance	5	4	5	3	4	3	4		3 2	1	34	355
SAF 603	Youth Programs	5	3	5	4	3	2	3		2 2	3.75	32.75	347.5
SAF 604	Occupational Safety	5	3	4	3	3	4	3		3 2	1.5	31.5	
SAF 605	Police/Law Enforcement	4	2	3	2	3	2	2		2 1	1.5	22.5	235
SAF 606	Chemical Safety	5	3	4	3	3	2	2		2 2	1.5	27.5	300
SAF 607	Crime Reporting	5	3	4	4	3	2	2		2 2	1.5	28.5	
SAF 608	Laboratory Safety	5	3	4	3	3	2	2		2 2	3	29	315

#### YSU FY 2020 Internal Audit Risk Assessment

#### Information Technology 700

Category#	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
IT 701	Data management, PII	4	5	5	3	5	5	4	4	4	3	42	430
IT 702	Records Retention	4	4	4	3	3	5	4	4	4	3	38	380
IT 703	Cyber Security	4	5	5	3	5	5	4	4	4	4	43	440

#### Academic & Student Affairs - 800

Category #	Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
		15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
ACA 801	Student Travel: Domestic and International	4	3	3	3	2	1	1		1	3	22	245
ACA 802	Student Organizations/Clubs (RSO)	4	3	4	4	3	3	2	:	1	3	29	295
ACA 803	Title IX, VAWA	1	5	5	5	5	5	4		4	2.25	39.25	382.5
ACA 804	Residence Life	5	3	4	3	4	3	3		1	3	32	325
ACA 805	Diversity	3	3	5	4	5	3	3		1	2.25	33.25	
ACA 806	Substance Abuse	4	3	4	3	4	1	2		1	5	30	315
ACA 807	Student Threat Assessment	4	2	5	4	4	1	1		1	5	31	320
ACA 808	Distance Learning	1	3	3	2	4	2	3		2	1.5	23.5	235
ACA 809	Student Admission	3	5	4	4	5	4	4	4	4	1.5	38.5	
ACA 810	Student Internships	1	2	3	2	3	1	1	1	1	3	18	190
ACA 811	Enrollment Growth	1	5	5	5	5	5	4		4	2	39	380
ACA 812	Student Special Needs	4	2	3	3	3	1	1	1	. 1	2	21	230
ACA 813	Student Data Management	3	5	5	4	4	5	3		5	2.25	39.25	407.5
	Study Abroad Programs	4	2	4	3	2	1	2	2	1	2.25	23.25	247.5
ACA 815	International Students	3	3	4	3	2	2	2	7	1	1.5	23.5	245

#### Other Areas Not Discretely Presented in ERM

Category# Activity	Health and Safety	Financial Impact	Public Image and Reputation	Outside Influence	Strategic Risks	Volume & Size	Change	Complexity	IT & System Risk	ERM Results	Total Risk	Weighted Risk Score
	15	15	15	5	10	5	5	5	15	10	100	
Endowment And Development	2	3	4	3	2	2	1	:	2 2	1	22	235
Parking Services	3	2	1	3	1	1	1	-	1	1	17	
Outsourced - Revenue Sharing/Commissions	2	3	3	3 2	1	2	2	11	1	1	18	190
UBIT	1	4	4	3	4	2	3	4	1	1	27	260
Strategic/Governance	4	4		4	5	5	5		3	1	41	395
Motor Pool	4	3		3	2	3	2		1	1	24	245
Radio	3	2		3	2	2	1		1	1	21	
Rich Center	5	3	4	5	3	3	2		3	1	32	330
Career Services	2	3	4	3	4	3	2		3	1	28	285
		ı	l .			1			1	1		

Prior Audits:	
2019	Payroll Process; Penguin Tuition Promise; and Continuous Monitoring
2018	Research Compliance; Procurement; and Continuous Monitoring
2017	YSU Foundation Agreement
2016	Compliance; Student Housing; James Dale Ethics Center; IT Security Access for Banner; Cash Counts; and Continuous Monitoring
2015	Academic Processes; IT (PII personally identifiable info and segregation of duties); Contract Mgmt., Title IV and Perkins Due Diligence; Travel and Continuous Monitoring
2014	Grants (YSU Research Foundation); IT, Business Expense Guidelines (pcard and employee expense reimbursements); Events Mgmt. and UBIT; and Continuous Monitoring
2013	Student Accounts and University Receivables; A/P; Social Media (as part of student affairs); and Continuous Monitoring
2012	Athletics; Human Resources; Facilities and Continuous Monitoring
2011	Budget; Financial Aid; Cash Management; Chargebacks; and Continuous Monitoring
2010	Human Resources; Payroll; Parking; Centennial Campaign; Continuous Monitoring of P/R and Purchasing
2009	Bookstore; Early College; Gifts; Payroll Projects; and Surprise Cash Counts
2008	Human Resource/Payroll; Budget; Petty Cash; Athletics, and Rich Center
2007	Grants; Metro College; Equipment and Facilities
2006	Human Resources; Contract Management; Admittance and Registration; Receiving and Purchasing
2005	Financial Aid; Accounting; Payroll; Gifts and IT