

**BOARD OF TRUSTEES
AUDIT SUBCOMMITTEE
Leonard D. Schiavone, Chair
James E. "Ted" Roberts, Vice Chair
Carole S. Weimer
David C. Deibel
STUDENT**

**BACKGROUND MATERIALS
Thursday, June 8, 2017**

- 1. Audit Subcommittee Charter and Internal Audit Charter** **Tab 1**
- 2. FY2016 ODHE Audit Results for Financial Aid** **Tab 2**
This report shows a Summary Error Report performed by the Ohio Department of Higher Education to determine federal and state compliance for standard reporting by YSU.

Youngstown State University
Audit Subcommittee Charter

Purpose

The primary function of the Audit Subcommittee is to assist the Board of Trustees in fulfilling its oversight responsibilities for the institution's accounting and financial reporting processes and audits by monitoring:

- the integrity of the University's financial statements,
- the independence, qualifications, and performance of its external and internal auditors,
- the University's system of internal controls, and
- the University's compliance with laws, regulations and codes of conduct.

Subject to State Auditor's role and requirements, the Audit Subcommittee will be responsible for the appointment, compensation, retention, oversight and evaluation of the University's external and internal auditors. The Audit Subcommittee shall maintain an effective, open avenue of communication among the external auditors, internal auditors, senior management and the Board of Trustees.

The Subcommittee's function is one of oversight, and as such it recognizes that management is responsible for preparing the financial statements and that the external auditors are responsible for auditing those financial statements.

The Subcommittee has the authority to retain legal, accounting and other advisors to assist in the performance of its responsibilities. The University shall compensate the independent auditors and advisors employed by the Audit Subcommittee, and provide for associated administrative expenses.

Structure

The Audit Subcommittee is a subcommittee of the Finance & Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University. Board members are appointed by the Governor of the State of Ohio. The Board will seek to ensure financial expertise on the Audit Subcommittee through appointments and training. Further, no member of the Audit Subcommittee may concurrently serve on the Investment Subcommittee.

Meetings

The Audit Subcommittee shall meet at least quarterly and at any other convenient date on an as-needed basis. The Audit Subcommittee may ask members of management or others to attend Audit Subcommittee meetings and provide pertinent information when needed. The Audit Subcommittee shall meet periodically with management, external auditors and the independent Internal Auditor.

Date Last Reviewed _____ 12-2015 _____

12-2015 Audit Subcommittee Charter

Youngstown State University
Audit Subcommittee Charter

Functions and Responsibilities

Internal Control

1. Review with management, Internal Audit and external auditors the adequacy and effectiveness of the University's policies for assessing and managing risk.
2. Examine internal and external auditors' findings of weaknesses and recommendations for the improvement of internal controls. Monitor management's response to and implementation of internal control recommendations.

Financial Reporting

1. Review annual financial statements prior to public release and discuss such statements with management and the independent auditors.
2. Discuss any changes in accounting principles, significant judgment areas and significant or complex transactions (including any off-balance sheet structures) that occurred. Consider management's handling of proposed audit adjustments identified by the independent auditors.
3. Consult with auditors and accounting personnel on the integrity of the internal and external financial reporting process. Determine if key reporting objectives are being met.

Independent Auditors

1. Serve as the authority to which the independent auditors report.
2. Review, at least annually, all relationships between the independent auditors and the University and assess the independent auditors' independence.
3. Review the audit scope and approach of the independent auditors' examinations and direct the auditors to areas that, in the Audit Subcommittee's opinion, require more attention. Audit engagement letters are to be addressed to the Audit Subcommittee rather than to management.
4. Discuss with the independent auditors any significant findings, difficulties, disagreements with management, restrictions on scope of the audit, or limitations on information or personnel encountered while performing the audit.
5. Pre-approve all significant audit and permitted non-audit services and related fees to be performed by the University's independent auditors. The Chairperson of the Audit Subcommittee shall have the authority to review and approve all such proposals and shall report back to the full Subcommittee at each meeting.

Internal Auditors

1. Review and examine the objectivity, effectiveness and resources of the internal audit function.
2. Concur in the appointment or replacement of the provider of internal audits services.
3. Review the internal audit plan for the current year and review the risk assessment procedures used to identify projects included in the plan.
4. Review the results of internal audit activities and track the progress of the internal audit plan.

Date Last Reviewed _____ 12-2015 _____

Youngstown State University
Audit Subcommittee Charter

Other

1. Ensure that appropriate code(s) of conduct/ethics are formalized in writing. Review management's monitoring of compliance therewith, including changes or waivers to the code(s).
2. Review legal and regulatory matters that may have a material impact on the financial statements and the related compliance policies and procedures.
3. Ensure that procedures exist for the receipt, retention and treatment of complaints regarding accounting, internal controls or auditing matters, including procedures for the confidential, anonymous submission by employees of concerns regarding questionable accounting or auditing matters. Periodically review summary reports of such complaints.
4. Review and assess, at least every three years, the Audit Subcommittee's charter and performance, and submit changes to the charter for approval of the Board.
5. Recommend to the Board policies for hiring employees or former employees of the independent auditor.
6. Perform other oversight functions as requested by the Board of Trustees.

Date Last Reviewed _____ 12-2015 _____

12-2015 Audit Subcommittee Charter

Youngstown State University
Internal Audit Charter

Introduction:

Internal Auditing is an independent and objective assurance and consulting activity that is guided by a philosophy of adding value to improve the operations of Youngstown State University (“the University”). It assists the University in accomplishing its objectives by bringing a systematic and disciplined approach to evaluate and improve the effectiveness of the University’s governance, risk management, and internal control.

Role:

The internal audit activity is established by the Board of Trustees (“Board”) and its responsibilities are defined by the Audit Subcommittee (“Subcommittee”) of the Board as part of its oversight role.

Professionalism:

The internal audit activity will govern itself by adherence to the Institute of Internal Auditors’ mandatory guidance including the Definition of Internal Auditing, Code of Ethics, and the *International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing (Standards)*. This mandatory guidance constitutes principles of the fundamental requirements for the professional practice of internal auditing and for evaluating the effectiveness of the internal audit activity’s performance.

The Institute of Internal Auditors’ Practice Advisories, Implementation Guides, and Position Papers will also be adhered to as applicable to guide operations. In addition, the internal audit activity will adhere to the University relevant policies and procedures.

Authority:

The internal audit activity, with strict accountability and confidentiality and safeguarding records and information, is authorized full, free, and unrestricted access to any and all of the University’s records, physical properties, and personnel pertinent to carrying out any audit engagement. All employees are expected to assist the internal audit activity in fulfilling its roles and responsibilities. The internal audit activity will also have free and unrestricted access to the Subcommittee and the Board.

Organization:

The Director of Internal Audit & Risk Management (“Director”) will report functionally to the Subcommittee and administratively (i.e. day to day operations) to the Vice President for Finance & Business Operations.

The Subcommittee will:

- Approve the internal audit charter.
- Approve the risk based internal audit plan
- Approve the internal audit budget and resource plan
- Receive communication from the Director on the internal audit activity’s performance relative to its plan and other matters.
- Approve decisions regarding the appointment and removal of the Director.
- Make appropriate inquiries of management and the Director of Internal Audit to determine whether there is inappropriate scope or resource limitations.

Independence and Objectivity:

The internal audit activity will remain free from interference by any element in the University, including matters of audit selection, scope, procedures, frequency, timing, or report content to permit maintenance of a necessary, independent and objective mental attitude.

Internal auditors will have no direct operational responsibility or authority over any of the activities audited. Accordingly, they will not implement internal controls, develop procedures, install systems, prepare records, or engage in any other activity that may impair an internal auditor’s judgment.

Internal auditors will exhibit the highest level of professional objectivity in gathering, evaluating, and communicating information about the activity or process being examined. Internal auditors will make a balanced assessment of all the relevant circumstances and not be unduly influenced by their own interests or by others in forming judgments.

The Director will confirm to the Subcommittee, at least annually, the organizational independence of the internal audit activity.

Responsibility:

The scope of internal auditing encompasses, but is not limited to, the examination and evaluation of the adequacy and effectiveness of the University’s governance, risk management, and internal controls as well as the quality of performance in carrying out assigned responsibilities to achieve the University’s stated goals and objectives. This includes:

- Evaluating risk exposure relating to achievement of the University's strategic objectives.
- Evaluating the reliability and integrity of information and the means used to identify, measure, classify, and report such information.
- Evaluating the systems established to ensure compliance with those policies, plans, procedures, laws, and regulations which could have a significant impact on the University.
- Evaluating the means of safeguarding assets and, as appropriate, verifying the existence of such assets.
- Evaluating the effectiveness and efficiency with which resources are employed.
- Evaluating operations or programs to ascertain whether results are consistent with established objectives and goals and whether the operations or programs are being carried out as planned.
- Monitoring and evaluating governance processes.
- Monitoring and evaluating the effectiveness of the University's risk management processes.
- Performing consulting and advisory services related to governance, risk management and control as appropriate for the University.
- Reporting periodically on the internal audit activity's purpose, authority, responsibility, and performance relative to its plan.
- Reporting significant risk exposures and control issues, including fraud risks, governance issues, and other matters needed or requested by the Subcommittee.
- Evaluating specific operations at the request of the Subcommittee or management, as appropriate.

Internal Audit Plan:

At least annually, the Director will submit to senior management and the Subcommittee an internal audit plan for review and approval by the Subcommittee. The internal audit plan will consist of a summary work schedule as well as budget and resource requirements for the next fiscal year. The Director will communicate the impact of resource limitations and significant interim changes to senior management and the Subcommittee. The internal audit plan will be developed based on a prioritization of the audit universe using a risk-based methodology, including input of senior management and the Subcommittee. The Director will review and adjust the plan, as necessary, in response to changes in the University's business, risks, operations, programs, systems, and controls. Any significant deviation from the approved internal audit plan will be communicated to senior management and the Subcommittee.

Reporting and Monitoring:

A written report will be prepared and issued by the Director or designee following the conclusion of each internal audit engagement and will be distributed as appropriate. Internal audit results will also be communicated to the Audit Subcommittee. The internal audit report will include management’s response and corrective action plan in regard to the specific findings and recommendations. Management's response should include a timetable for anticipated completion of action to be taken and an explanation for any corrective action that will not be implemented. The internal audit activity will be responsible for appropriate follow-up on engagement findings and recommendations. All significant findings will remain in an open issues file until cleared.

The Director will periodically report to senior management and the Subcommittee on the internal audit activity’s purpose, authority, and responsibility, as well as performance relative to its plan. Reporting will also include significant risk exposures and control issues, including fraud risks, governance issues, and other matters needed or requested by senior management or the Subcommittee.

Internal Audit Activity Charter

Approved this 30th day of November, 2016.

Director, Internal Audit & Risk Management

Chair of Audit Subcommittee

Vice President of Finance & Business Operations



**Department of
Higher Education**

**John R. Kasich, Governor
John Gasey, Chancellor**

April 10, 2017

**Ms. Elaine Ruse
Director, Office of Financial Aid and Scholarships
Youngstown State University
One University Plaza
Youngstown, OH 44555-0001**

Dear Ms. Ruse:

As you are aware, my staff recently audited financial aid records for the 2016 fiscal year to determine compliance with federal and state reporting standards. A total of 900 records were reviewed for this audit. Materials reviewed included the student's application, transcript, class schedule and statement of account.

I am enclosing the auditor's "Summary Error Report". This report displays all data items audited and the number of errors reported for each item.

According to this final report of the 900 records reviewed for this audit, there were "0" errors (or a 0.0% overall error rate).

I commend you and your staff for such excellent record keeping and reporting. Your audit for the 2016 fiscal year is officially closed.

If you have any questions, please contact Alyssa Ooten by telephone at (614) 387-1013, or by email at aooten@highered.ohio.gov.

Sincerely,

**Jim Bennett
Vice Chancellor, Finance and Data Management**

Copy to: Mr. James Tressel, President

Attachment: Summary Error Report



Ohio Department of Higher Education Audit YNGS 2016

Financial Aid Audit Summary

4/10/2017

<u>Data Item</u>	<u>Number of Possible Errors</u>	<u>Total Records Reviewed</u>	<u>Percentage of Possible Anomalies</u>
Residency	0	100	0.00
Selective Service	0	100	0.00
Fulltime Enrollment	0	100	0.00
Tuition Charges	0	100	0.00
Degree Program	0	100	0.00
Benefit Refund	0	100	0.00
Made Acad Progress	0	100	0.00
Disbursement Applied	0	100	0.00
Benefit Source Documented	0	100	0.00

<u>Summary:</u>	<u>Total Number of Possible Errors</u>	<u>Total Records Reviewed</u>	<u>Total Percentage of Anomalies</u>
	<u>0</u>	<u>988</u>	<u>0.0</u>