

Revised

**BOARD OF TRUSTEES
FINANCE AND FACILITIES COMMITTEE**

John R. Jakubek, Chair

Scott R. Schulick, Vice Chair

All Trustees are Members

Cynthia E. Anderson, *Ex-Officio*

**Tuesday, December 4, 2012
3:00 p.m. or immediately following
previous meeting**

**Tod Hall
Board Meeting Room**

AGENDA

- A. Disposition of Minutes for Meeting Held September 18, 2012**
- B. Old Business**
- C. Committee Items**

1. Finance

a. Finance Action Items

- 1) Resolution to Renew Audit Subcommittee Charter** **Tab 1**
Katrena Davidson, Interim Controller, will report.
- 2) Resolution to Approve Interfund Transfers** **Tab 2**
Katrena Davidson, Interim Controller, will report.

b. Finance Discussion Items

- 1) Update on University Budget Fiscal Year 2012-2013**
Gene Grilli, Vice President for Finance and Administration, and Neal McNally, Interim Associate Vice President, Budget Planning and Analysis/ Treasurer, will report.
- 2) Report of Audit Subcommittee**
A verbal report of the Audit Subcommittee will be presented. John Jakubek will report.

3) Report of Investment Subcommittee

A verbal report of the Investment Subcommittee will be presented. Scott R. Schulick will report.

2. Facilities

a. Facilities Action Item

1) Resolution to Modify Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects Policy

Tab 3

Gene Grilli, Vice President for Finance and Administration, and John Hyden, Executive Director for Facilities, will report.

b. Facilities Discussion Items

1) Planning and Construction Projects Update

Tab 4

An update of current and planned construction projects throughout campus, such as West of Fifth, Demolition of Pilgrim Collegiate Church, Melnick, Cushwa and DeBartolo Halls. Gene Grilli, Vice President for Finance and Administration, will report.

2) Report on University Site for Veterans Center

Gene Grilli, Vice President for Finance and Administration, will report.

D. New Business

E. Adjournment



RESOLUTION TO RENEW AUDIT SUBCOMMITTEE CHARTER

WHEREAS, the Audit Subcommittee Charter provides that the Subcommittee's Charter and performance shall be reviewed and assessed at least every three years, and that any changes to the Subcommittee's Charter shall be submitted to the Board of Trustees for approval; and

WHEREAS, the Audit Subcommittee's Charter and performance have been reviewed and assessed; and

WHEREAS, the changes to the Charter are recommended for approval by the Board of Trustees;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University does hereby approve and renew the Audit Subcommittee Charter as written.

**Board of Trustees Meeting
December 12, 2012
YR 2013-**



**RESOLUTION TO APPROVE
INTERFUND TRANSFERS**

WHEREAS, Policy Number 3010.01, Budget Transfers, of the *University Guidebook*, requires Board of Trustees approval for interfund transfers of \$100,000 or more; and

WHEREAS, certain accounting adjustments and transfers outside the operating budget are necessary;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University does hereby approve transfers outside the operating budget, as detailed in Exhibit ____.

**Board of Trustees Meeting
December 12, 2012
YR 2013-**



YOUNGSTOWN STATE UNIVERSITY
Interfund Transfers Requiring Board Approval
Transfers Outside of the Operating Budget
Requested Transfers for Second Quarter 2013

FROM	TO	AMOUNT	REASON
Academic Building Renovations - Bond Proceeds (Restricted Plant Fund)	West of 5th Avenue Fields - Bond Proceeds (Restricted Plant Fund)	\$2,250,000	Transfer funds to new projects.
General Fund Operating Reserve (Unrestricted Quasi-Endowment Fund)	Budget Stabilization Reserve (Designated Fund)	\$1,000,000	As part of FY2013 contingency plan, to rescind budgeted transfer to Operating Reserve in response to enrollment decline.
Intercollegiate Athletics (Auxiliary Fund)	Budget Stabilization Reserve (Designated Fund)	\$259,038	As part of FY2013 contingency plan, to rescind the FY2013 increase in Athletics' General Fund support in response to enrollment decline.

YSU CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS UPDATE – NOVEMBER 7, 2012

Academic Building Renovations Project – The first phase of the Academic Building Project is complete and included renovations to the auditoriums in Cushwa Hall, DeBartolo Hall, Moser Hall and Ward Beecher. An additional auditorium in Beeghly Center will be renovated the summer of 2013. Design work is by Facilities and Media and Academic Computing staff.

Following this initial project will be general renovation projects in Cushwa Hall and DeBartolo Hall. The renovations will include but not be limited to flooring, lighting, wall finishes, major mechanical system upgrades and building exterior repairs. This project will begin the summer of 2013 and be complete in time for fall classes.

M1 Parking Deck Repairs – We will continue with preventative maintenance during the summer of 2013 on the M1 parking deck to ensure its long term viability. Bid documents will be developed over this winter and the project will bid in the spring of 2013.

Chilled Water Storage Deck Repairs – The Chilled Water Storage Tank is located just east of the Central Utility Plant and has a concrete deck on top of it that is used for parking. The deck has deteriorated and is in need of repairs. As part of the deck repairs for 2013, this area will be addressed.

Athletic Fields West of Fifth – This project has begun and is well underway. All base-bid items and alternate items were accepted and include a synthetic soccer field, all weather track, softball field, fencing and lighting for the soccer field, and fencing around the entire site. Additional items will also be added and are currently under design by our associate GPD Group. These items include a restroom/concession facility, track and softball stands, softball dugouts with scorer's box and pitcher's warm-up area, lighting for the softball field, walkways and general site lighting.

It is anticipated that the base-bid items will be complete by April 2013 weather permitting with the additional items and complete build-out being finished by late summer 2013.

Campus Elevators Upgrades – This initial project is complete. It consisted of complete renovations to the Kilcawley House elevator and both Cushwa Hall south elevators. The next phase of this project will consist of the Cushwa Hall north elevators and the mid-floor elevator in Maag Library. There will also be evaluations of the elevators across campus with additional work taking place late summer 2013 or summer 2014.

Bliss Hall Music Practice Rooms – Originally constructed in the 1970's, the practice rooms in Bliss Hall are small spaces constructed of hard materials that reverberate sounds within the rooms and project the sounds into the surround spaces causing disruptions in the corridors and adjacent instructional spaces. This project will address the acoustics within the rooms and also reduce the sound infiltration into adjacent spaces.

Construction started in late May 2012 and substantial completion concluded prior to the start of fall classes. Some long lead items such as acoustic doors, acoustical wall treatments and other miscellaneous items will be completed over winter break this December and January.

Wind Turbine Project – Working with CJL Engineering and the department of Mechanical Engineering Technology with funding through a Department of Energy grant, Facilities is assisting with the installation of wind turbines behind Melnick Hall and along the East Bound Service Road. Three wind turbines will be installed on 80' towers and data from these turbines will be collected and studied by the Engineering Technology department.

This project was competitively bid with Zenith Systems being the low bidder. This project is on hold while the Department of Energy evaluates the location of the turbines and their proximity to a historic district along Wick Avenue. We will know more about the construction start and completion dates once they have made their determination.

Basketball/Olympic Sports Weight Room – This project will be the construction of a weight room on the long deck in Beeghly Center that will be used by the basketball team and by members of Olympic sports teams. Construction is scheduled to begin December 2012 and conclude in March 2013.

Melnick Hall Renovations – Preliminary work is beginning on renovation plans to Melnick Hall. Currently the Journalism program, WYSU, Jambar, Rookery Radio and parts of Telecommunications will occupy the building. We have requested \$2.5million in our capital request specifically earmarked for Melnick with additional funds coming from bond proceeds for a total project of \$4.5M.

Strollo Architects was chosen as the design consultant and a contract is being developed. Once Strollo is under contract, design work will begin.

Pilgrim Church – Work is underway by Facilities staff to develop drawings and specifications for the demolition of this building. Some stained glass windows have already been removed and efforts are underway to find homes for the remaining windows. Demolition is anticipated over winter break.

Building System Upgrades; 4160v Loop Repair – YSU has its own sub-station where power is brought on to campus and distributed out to our buildings. Most of our buildings are fed off of a "loop" from the sub-station which provides a redundant source of power so that in the event of one part of the loop failing, the other part of the loop can continue to supply power. As part of the Campus Wide Building System Upgrades project, major building systems such as voltage loops, steam lines and HVAC systems will be upgraded or replaced helping to ensure little to no disruption in service to our campus community.

In this project, a critical portion of a damaged power loop from our sub-station to our student dorms will be replaced. Replacing this line will ensure a redundant, reliable supply of power to our student housing.

This project was competitively bid and B&J Electric was the low bidder. This project has started and should be complete by early 2013.

Veterans Affairs – Located on the former site of the Peck House, a new building will be constructed to house Veterans Affairs. Through recent construction reform, new project delivery methods are available to use and for this project, we will use design-build. Design build is a construction method where by a specification, or criteria, is developed that details what the building is, how it should look, the types and size of spaces, etc. and then design-build contractors use this criteria to develop their proposal. Using this method will generally speed up the process and get the project started earlier than using traditional design-bid-build methods. We are anticipating this project to start early summer of 2013 and be complete by early 2014.

YSU Capital Construction Update

1/31/2012

Project	Cost	Est. Const. Start	Completion	Funding Source				
				Bonds	Gifts	Capital	YSU Local	Kilcawley
Veterans Affairs	\$225,000	January 2012	May 2012		X			X
Phelps Building Roof	\$200,000	October 2011	December 2011					X
Lincoln Building Roof	\$250,000	April 2012	July 2012					X
M2 Deck Renovations Phase 2	\$950,000	May 2012	August 2012	X				
M1 Deck Renovations	\$300,000	May 2012	August 2012				X	
Campus Tunnel Renovations	\$400,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Pollock House	\$3,000,000	September 2011	June 2012	X	X			
Elevators: Kilcawley House	\$200,000	May 2012	August 2012				X	
Cushwa Hall South	\$450,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Bliss Hall Practice Rooms	\$350,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Auditoriums	\$2,500,000							X
Cushwa Hall		May 2012	August 2012					
Ward Beecher		May 2012	August 2012					
DeBartolo Hall		May 2012	August 2012					
Beeghly Center 104		May 2012	August 2012					
Cushwa/Debartolo Entryways	\$350,000	Dec 2012	January 2013					X
Athletic Fields West of Fifth	\$1,875,000	April 2012	August 2012	X				
Total	\$11,050,000							

Bonds Funds from the sale of bonds
 Gifts Funds from gifts to the university
 Capital State capital (reappropriated basic renovation) funds
 YSU Local Funds from auxiliaries
 Kilcawley Funds transferred from the Kilcawley Center project

Project	Cost	Est. Const. Start	Completion	Funding Source				
				Bonds	Gifts	Capital	YSU Local	Kilcawley
Veterans Affairs	\$1,250,000	August 2013	April 2014		X			X
Campus Core Lighting*	\$495,000	June 2013	August 2013			X		
Concrete Replacement	\$500,000	June 2013	August 2013			X		
Melnick Hall Renovation	\$4,500,000	June 2013	March 2014		X	X		X
Academic Building Phase II	\$4,450,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		X
Campus Tunnel Renovations*	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Campus Roof Renovations		TBD	TBD			X		
Elevators: I Maag Library	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Cushwa Hall North	\$500,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Wind Turbines	\$125,000	TBD	TBD				Grant	
M1 Parking Deck/Chilled Water Lot	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013				X	
4160v Project	\$250,000	September 2012	January 2013			X		
Dental Hygiene Lab Renovations	\$200,000	December 2012	February 2013		X			
Tennis/Golf Locker Rooms	\$175,000	December 2012	February 2013				X	
Beeghly Center Auditorium	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013					X
Basketball/Olympic Sports Weight Room	\$127,000	December 2012	March 2013				X	
Beeghly Center HPE Addition##	\$200,000	April 2013	August 2013				X	
Pilgram Church Demo	\$75,000	December 2012	January 2013				X	
Athletic Fields West of Fifth	\$4,350,000	September 2012	August 2013	X				X
Total	\$18,797,000							

- Bonds Funds from the sale of bonds
- Gifts Funds from gifts to the university
- Capital State capital (reappropriated basic renovation) funds
- YSU Local Funds from auxiliaries
- Kilcawley Funds transferred from the Kilcawley Center project

Timeline based on starting in November 2012

*Tentative project, will be complete if time permits

Explanation of Modifications to *Guidebook Policy*:

7004.01 Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects

This policy was revised to incorporate language for the design-build project delivery method.



**RESOLUTION TO MODIFY
SELECTION OF ARCHITECTS/ENGINEERS FOR UNIVERSITY
CAPITAL PROJECTS POLICY**

WHEREAS, the Institutional Policies are being reviewed and reconceptualized on an ongoing basis; and

WHEREAS, this process can result in the modification of existing policies, the creation of new policies, or the deletion of policies no longer needed; and

WHEREAS, action is required by the Board of Trustees prior to replacing and/or implementing modified or newly created policies, or to rescind existing policies;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University does hereby approve the modification of the Institutional Policy governing Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects, policy number 4007.01 of the *University Guidebook*, shown as Exhibit __ attached hereto. A copy of the policy indicating changes to be made is also attached.

**Board of Trustees Meeting
December 12, 2012
YR 2013-**

UNIVERSITY GUIDEBOOK

Title of Policy:	Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects
Responsible Division/Office:	Finance and Administration
Approving Officer:	Vice President for Finance and Administration
Revision History:	June 2002; June 2008; November 2012
Resolution Number(s):	YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50; YR 2013-
Board Committee:	Finance and Facilities
EFFECTIVE DATE:	
Next review:	2017

Policy: Selection of architects/engineers for University capital projects is based on size, complexity, and estimated cost of the project. Smaller projects, less than \$500k, may be completed by the University architect and internal personnel or by an external architect/engineer. For projects requiring an external architect/engineer, a competitive selection process will be used based upon an evaluation of submitted proposals. Selection of external architect/engineers for projects over \$500,000 will involve the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees, and may include the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC). Projects limited in scope to mechanical, electrical, structural, or building envelope maintenance will not be subject to this policy. In selected cases, State authorized alternative project delivery methods may be utilized.

Parameters:

- All projects subject to this policy will be publicly advertised according to institutional or state requirements. At a minimum, all projects subject to this policy will be advertised in *The Vindicator*.

- Approved projects will be shared, for information purposes, at regularly scheduled meetings of the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees. It is recognized that on rare occasions, and where timely decisions are required, it may not be feasible to immediately convene a meeting of the Finance and Facilities Committee. In such cases, the University President and the Finance and Facilities Committee Chairperson will agree upon an appropriate procedure to be followed.
- The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will determine the appropriate representative(s) to serve on the Project Teams, in consultation with the area officer for the project's user department.

Procedures:

There are four general procedures that may be used to determine the use and selection of architects/engineers for capital projects. It is recognized that under a particular situation, one or more modifications may need to be made to accommodate the requirements of a specific project.

The Associate Director of Planning and Construction will prepare a preliminary estimate of costs and scope of all projects. A recommendation including these factors and the capability of internal personnel to complete the project will be submitted to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for determination of the procedures to be followed.

Classification One (1). Capital Projects Designed by University Staff or by External Architects/Engineers (\$500,000 or less)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more "users" of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Team Chairperson will work closely with the members of the department/unit that will occupy the space being designed and maintain the scope and costs of the project within the availability of project funds.
4. If it is determined that University personnel have the time and capability to complete the project, it will be designed and managed internally and will not be advertised to external firms.

5. If the Project Team or the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services determines that an external architect/engineer is required to design and manage a project, the committee will comply with DAS/OSA procedures to select an Associate. The Team will recommend a firm to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for approval.

Classification Two (2). Capital Projects Locally Administered and Designed by External Architects/Engineers (over \$500,000)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more “users” of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Project Team will determine the desired qualifications needed by the architect/engineer for the project. These qualifications, along with the scope of the project, will be stated in the Request for Proposals (RFP).
4. The RFP will be sent to an appropriate number of design firms who have expressed an interest in being considered for University projects. Additional firms will be solicited through an advertisement in *The Vindicator* and an RFP to the *Ohio Register*.
5. The Project Team will evaluate submitted proposals and, if appropriate, interview firms in accordance with Ohio Department of Administrative Services procedures. The Team will submit a ranked list of firms, based on average composite scores and with recommendations, to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services.
6. The Team’s ranked list and recommendations will be shared with the Executive Vice President for consideration and counsel with the President.
7. The President will submit to the Finance and Facilities Committee an unranked list of three to five top-scoring firms, along with the rationale (pros and cons) provided by the Project Team.
8. A copy of the RFP and the Responses to the Request for Proposals provided by the firms recommended for interviews will be provided to the Finance and Facilities Committee. The order in which firms are interviewed will be determined by a draw.
9. Firms will be afforded a maximum of one hour for the presentation to the Committee. The presentation will be followed by a question-and-answer period.

10. The Finance and Facilities Committee, provided a quorum, and after full discussion, will vote by roll call to select the proposal to be adopted. The adopted proposal must receive a majority vote. If no proposal receives a majority vote, the Committee will continue the discussion and will vote until such time as a majority vote is achieved. If necessary, the Committee may adopt a tiebreaker procedure. Failing adoption of a proposal, the Committee may request a resubmission of proposals.

11. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Three (3). Capital Projects Administered by the State and Designed by External Architects/Engineers

1. All State Department of Administrative Services procedures, including advertising and determination of firms selected for interview, will be followed.
2. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC) will interview the firms recommended for consideration. In addition to the President and Executive Vice President, the Committee may invite others to participate in the process.
3. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the OFCC will follow the procedures established by the OFCC to select the architect/engineer for the project.
4. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Four (4). Alternative Project Delivery Methods

On a case-by-case basis, the administration may designate a capital project for construction using the “design-build” delivery method. The University administration will select the design-build firm and will inform the Board of Trustees at their next regularly scheduled meeting.

The University will follow the guidelines for this alternative delivery method as established by the OFCC.

REDLINE VERSION
UNIVERSITY GUIDEBOOK

Subject: Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects

Developed by: Eugene Grilli	Authorized by: Eugene Grilli
Title: Vice President for Finance and Administration	Title: Vice President for Finance and Administration
Approved: June 20, 2008	EFFECTIVE: June 20, 2008
Revised: June 28, 2002	
June 20, 2008	

**Title of Policy: Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital
Projects**

Responsible Division/Office: Finance and Administration

Approving Officer: Vice President for Finance and Administration

Revision History: June 2002; June 2008; November 2012

Resolution Number(s): YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50; YR 2013-

Board Committee: Finance and Facilities

EFFECTIVE DATE:

Next review: 2017

Policy: Selection of architects/engineers for University capital projects is based on size, complexity, and estimated cost of the project. Smaller projects, less than \$500k, may be completed by the University architect and internal personnel or by an external architect/engineer. For projects requiring an external architect/engineer, a competitive selection process will be used based upon an evaluation of submitted proposals. Selection of external architect/engineers for projects over \$500,000 will involve the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees, and may include the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ **Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC)**. Projects limited in scope to mechanical, electrical, structural, or building envelope maintenance will not be subject to this policy. **In selected cases, State authorized alternative project delivery methods may be utilized.**

~~RESOLUTION NUMBER: YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50~~

Parameters:

- All projects subject to this policy will be publicly advertised according to institutional or state requirements. At a minimum, all projects subject to this policy will be advertised in *The Vindicator*.
- Approved projects will be shared, for information purposes, at regularly scheduled meetings of the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees. It is recognized that on rare occasions, and where timely decisions are required, it may not be feasible to immediately convene a meeting of the Finance and Facilities Committee. In such cases, the University President and the Finance and Facilities Committee Chairperson will agree upon an appropriate procedure to be followed.
- The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will determine the appropriate representative(s) to serve on the Project Teams, in consultation with the area officer for the project's user department.

Procedures:

There are ~~three~~ **four** general procedures that may be used to determine the use and selection of architects/engineers for capital projects. It is recognized that under a particular situation, one or more modifications may need to be made to accommodate the requirements of a specific project.

The Associate Director of Planning and Construction will prepare a preliminary estimate of costs and scope of all projects. A recommendation including these factors and the capability of internal personnel to complete the project will be submitted to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for determination of the procedures to be followed.

Classification One (1). Capital Projects Designed by University Staff or by External Architects/Engineers (\$500,000 or less)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more "users" of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Team Chairperson will work closely with the members of the department/unit that will occupy the space being designed and maintain the scope and costs of the project within the availability of project funds.

4. If it is determined that University personnel have the time and capability to complete the project, it will be designed and managed internally and will not be advertised to external firms.
5. If the Project Team or the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services determines that an external architect/engineer is required to design and manage a project, the committee will comply with DAS/OSA procedures to select an Associate. The Team will recommend a firm to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for approval.

Classification Two (2). Capital Projects Locally Administered and Designed by External Architects/Engineers (over \$500,000)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more “users” of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Project Team will determine the desired qualifications needed by the architect/engineer for the project. These qualifications, along with the scope of the project, will be stated in the Request for Proposals (RFP).
4. The RFP will be sent to an appropriate number of design firms who have expressed an interest in being considered for University projects. Additional firms will be solicited through an advertisement in *The Vindicator* and an RFP to the *Ohio Register*.
5. The Project Team will evaluate submitted proposals and, if appropriate, interview firms in accordance with Ohio Department of Administrative Services procedures. The Team will submit a ranked list of firms, based on average composite scores and with recommendations, to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services.
6. The Team’s ranked list and recommendations will be shared with the Executive Vice President for consideration and counsel with the President.
7. The President will submit to the Finance and Facilities Committee an unranked list of three to five top-scoring firms, along with the rationale (pros and cons) provided by the Project Team.
8. A copy of the RFP and the Responses to the Request for Proposals provided by the firms recommended for interviews will be provided to the Finance and Facilities Committee. The order in which firms are interviewed will be determined by a draw.

9. Firms will be afforded a maximum of one hour for the presentation to the Committee. The presentation will be followed by a question-and-answer period.
10. The Finance and Facilities Committee, provided a quorum, and after full discussion, will vote by roll call to select the proposal to be adopted. The adopted proposal must receive a majority vote. If no proposal receives a majority vote, the Committee will continue the discussion and will vote until such time as a majority vote is achieved. If necessary, the Committee may adopt a tiebreaker procedure. Failing adoption of a proposal, the Committee may request a resubmission of proposals.
11. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Three (3). Capital Projects Administered by the State and Designed by External Architects/Engineers

1. All State Department of Administrative Services procedures, including advertising and determination of firms selected for interview, will be followed.
2. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC) will interview the firms recommended for consideration. In addition to the President and Executive Vice President, the Committee may invite others to participate in the process.
3. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ OFCC will follow the procedures established by the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ OFCC to select the architect/engineer for the project.
4. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Four (4). Alternative Project Delivery Methods

On a case-by-case basis, the administration may designate a capital project for construction using the “design-build” delivery method. The University administration will select the design-build firm and will inform the Board of Trustees at their next regularly scheduled meeting.

The University will follow the guidelines for this alternative delivery method as established by the OFCC.

Explanation of Modifications to *Guidebook Policy*:

7004.01 Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects

This policy was revised to incorporate language for the design-build project delivery method.

**RESOLUTION TO MODIFY
SELECTION OF ARCHITECTS/ENGINEERS FOR UNIVERSITY
CAPITAL PROJECTS POLICY**

WHEREAS, the Institutional Policies are being reviewed and reconceptualized on an ongoing basis; and

WHEREAS, this process can result in the modification of existing policies, the creation of new policies, or the deletion of policies no longer needed; and

WHEREAS, action is required by the Board of Trustees prior to replacing and/or implementing modified or newly created policies, or to rescind existing policies;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board of Trustees of Youngstown State University does hereby approve the modification of the Institutional Policy governing Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects, policy number 4007.01 of the *University Guidebook*, shown as Exhibit __ attached hereto. A copy of the policy indicating changes to be made is also attached.

UNIVERSITY GUIDEBOOK

Title of Policy:	Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects
Responsible Division/Office:	Finance and Administration
Approving Officer:	Vice President for Finance and Administration
Revision History:	June 2002; June 2008; November 2012
Resolution Number(s):	YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50; YR 2013-
Board Committee:	Finance and Facilities
EFFECTIVE DATE:	
Next review:	2017

Policy: Selection of architects/engineers for University capital projects is based on size, complexity, and estimated cost of the project. Smaller projects, less than \$500k, may be completed by the University architect and internal personnel or by an external architect/engineer. For projects requiring an external architect/engineer, a competitive selection process will be used based upon an evaluation of submitted proposals. Selection of external architect/engineers for projects over \$500,000 will involve the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees, and may include the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC). Projects limited in scope to mechanical, electrical, structural, or building envelope maintenance will not be subject to this policy. In selected cases, State authorized alternative project delivery methods may be utilized.

Parameters:

- All projects subject to this policy will be publicly advertised according to institutional or state requirements. At a minimum, all projects subject to this policy will be advertised in *The Vindicator*.

- Approved projects will be shared, for information purposes, at regularly scheduled meetings of the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees. It is recognized that on rare occasions, and where timely decisions are required, it may not be feasible to immediately convene a meeting of the Finance and Facilities Committee. In such cases, the University President and the Finance and Facilities Committee Chairperson will agree upon an appropriate procedure to be followed.
- The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will determine the appropriate representative(s) to serve on the Project Teams, in consultation with the area officer for the project's user department.

Procedures:

There are four general procedures that may be used to determine the use and selection of architects/engineers for capital projects. It is recognized that under a particular situation, one or more modifications may need to be made to accommodate the requirements of a specific project.

The Associate Director of Planning and Construction will prepare a preliminary estimate of costs and scope of all projects. A recommendation including these factors and the capability of internal personnel to complete the project will be submitted to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for determination of the procedures to be followed.

Classification One (1). Capital Projects Designed by University Staff or by External Architects/Engineers (\$500,000 or less)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more "users" of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Team Chairperson will work closely with the members of the department/unit that will occupy the space being designed and maintain the scope and costs of the project within the availability of project funds.
4. If it is determined that University personnel have the time and capability to complete the project, it will be designed and managed internally and will not be advertised to external firms.

5. If the Project Team or the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services determines that an external architect/engineer is required to design and manage a project, the committee will comply with DAS/OSA procedures to select an Associate. The Team will recommend a firm to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for approval.

Classification Two (2). Capital Projects Locally Administered and Designed by External Architects/Engineers (over \$500,000)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more “users” of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Project Team will determine the desired qualifications needed by the architect/engineer for the project. These qualifications, along with the scope of the project, will be stated in the Request for Proposals (RFP).
4. The RFP will be sent to an appropriate number of design firms who have expressed an interest in being considered for University projects. Additional firms will be solicited through an advertisement in *The Vindicator* and an RFP to the *Ohio Register*.
5. The Project Team will evaluate submitted proposals and, if appropriate, interview firms in accordance with Ohio Department of Administrative Services procedures. The Team will submit a ranked list of firms, based on average composite scores and with recommendations, to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services.
6. The Team’s ranked list and recommendations will be shared with the Executive Vice President for consideration and counsel with the President.
7. The President will submit to the Finance and Facilities Committee an unranked list of three to five top-scoring firms, along with the rationale (pros and cons) provided by the Project Team.
8. A copy of the RFP and the Responses to the Request for Proposals provided by the firms recommended for interviews will be provided to the Finance and Facilities Committee. The order in which firms are interviewed will be determined by a draw.
9. Firms will be afforded a maximum of one hour for the presentation to the Committee. The presentation will be followed by a question-and-answer period.

10. The Finance and Facilities Committee, provided a quorum, and after full discussion, will vote by roll call to select the proposal to be adopted. The adopted proposal must receive a majority vote. If no proposal receives a majority vote, the Committee will continue the discussion and will vote until such time as a majority vote is achieved. If necessary, the Committee may adopt a tiebreaker procedure. Failing adoption of a proposal, the Committee may request a resubmission of proposals.

11. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Three (3). Capital Projects Administered by the State and Designed by External Architects/Engineers

1. All State Department of Administrative Services procedures, including advertising and determination of firms selected for interview, will be followed.

2. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC) will interview the firms recommended for consideration. In addition to the President and Executive Vice President, the Committee may invite others to participate in the process.

3. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the OFCC will follow the procedures established by the OFCC to select the architect/engineer for the project.

4. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Four (4). Alternative Project Delivery Methods

On a case-by-case basis, the administration may designate a capital project for construction using the “design-build” delivery method. The University administration will select the design-build firm and will inform the Board of Trustees at their next regularly scheduled meeting.

The University will follow the guidelines for this alternative delivery method as established by the OFCC.

REDLINE VERSION
UNIVERSITY GUIDEBOOK

Subject: Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital Projects

Developed by: Eugene Grilli	Authorized by: Eugene Grilli
Title: Vice-President for Finance and Administration	Title: Vice-President for Finance and Administration
Approved: June 20, 2008	EFFECTIVE: June 20, 2008
Revised: June 28, 2002	
June 20, 2008	

**Title of Policy: Selection of Architects/Engineers for University Capital
Projects**

Responsible Division/Office: Finance and Administration

Approving Officer: Vice President for Finance and Administration

Revision History: June 2002; June 2008; November 2012

Resolution Number(s): YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50; YR 2013-

Board Committee: Finance and Facilities

EFFECTIVE DATE:

Next review: 2017

Policy: Selection of architects/engineers for University capital projects is based on size, complexity, and estimated cost of the project. Smaller projects, less than \$500k, may be completed by the University architect and internal personnel or by an external architect/engineer. For projects requiring an external architect/engineer, a competitive selection process will be used based upon an evaluation of submitted proposals. Selection of external architect/engineers for projects over \$500,000 will involve the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees, and may include the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ **Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC)**. Projects limited in scope to mechanical, electrical, structural, or building envelope maintenance will not be subject to this policy. **In selected cases, State authorized alternative project delivery methods may be utilized.**

~~RESOLUTION NUMBER: YR 1999-20; YR 2002-52; YR 2008-50~~

Parameters:

- All projects subject to this policy will be publicly advertised according to institutional or state requirements. At a minimum, all projects subject to this policy will be advertised in *The Vindicator*.
- Approved projects will be shared, for information purposes, at regularly scheduled meetings of the Finance and Facilities Committee of the Board of Trustees. It is recognized that on rare occasions, and where timely decisions are required, it may not be feasible to immediately convene a meeting of the Finance and Facilities Committee. In such cases, the University President and the Finance and Facilities Committee Chairperson will agree upon an appropriate procedure to be followed.
- The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will determine the appropriate representative(s) to serve on the Project Teams, in consultation with the area officer for the project's user department.

Procedures:

There are ~~three~~ **four** general procedures that may be used to determine the use and selection of architects/engineers for capital projects. It is recognized that under a particular situation, one or more modifications may need to be made to accommodate the requirements of a specific project.

The Associate Director of Planning and Construction will prepare a preliminary estimate of costs and scope of all projects. A recommendation including these factors and the capability of internal personnel to complete the project will be submitted to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for determination of the procedures to be followed.

Classification One (1). Capital Projects Designed by University Staff or by External Architects/Engineers (\$500,000 or less)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more "users" of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Team Chairperson will work closely with the members of the department/unit that will occupy the space being designed and maintain the scope and costs of the project within the availability of project funds.

4. If it is determined that University personnel have the time and capability to complete the project, it will be designed and managed internally and will not be advertised to external firms.
5. If the Project Team or the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services determines that an external architect/engineer is required to design and manage a project, the committee will comply with DAS/OSA procedures to select an Associate. The Team will recommend a firm to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services for approval.

Classification Two (2). Capital Projects Locally Administered and Designed by External Architects/Engineers (over \$500,000)

1. The Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services will appoint a Project Team and Chairperson for each project.
2. The Team will typically include two or three University professional staff members and one or more “users” of the space to be constructed. The Team Chairperson will maintain and regularly distribute minutes of all meetings.
3. The Project Team will determine the desired qualifications needed by the architect/engineer for the project. These qualifications, along with the scope of the project, will be stated in the Request for Proposals (RFP).
4. The RFP will be sent to an appropriate number of design firms who have expressed an interest in being considered for University projects. Additional firms will be solicited through an advertisement in *The Vindicator* and an RFP to the *Ohio Register*.
5. The Project Team will evaluate submitted proposals and, if appropriate, interview firms in accordance with Ohio Department of Administrative Services procedures. The Team will submit a ranked list of firms, based on average composite scores and with recommendations, to the Executive Director of Facilities and Support Services.
6. The Team’s ranked list and recommendations will be shared with the Executive Vice President for consideration and counsel with the President.
7. The President will submit to the Finance and Facilities Committee an unranked list of three to five top-scoring firms, along with the rationale (pros and cons) provided by the Project Team.
8. A copy of the RFP and the Responses to the Request for Proposals provided by the firms recommended for interviews will be provided to the Finance and Facilities Committee. The order in which firms are interviewed will be determined by a draw.

9. Firms will be afforded a maximum of one hour for the presentation to the Committee. The presentation will be followed by a question-and-answer period.
10. The Finance and Facilities Committee, provided a quorum, and after full discussion, will vote by roll call to select the proposal to be adopted. The adopted proposal must receive a majority vote. If no proposal receives a majority vote, the Committee will continue the discussion and will vote until such time as a majority vote is achieved. If necessary, the Committee may adopt a tiebreaker procedure. Failing adoption of a proposal, the Committee may request a resubmission of proposals.
11. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Three (3). Capital Projects Administered by the State and Designed by External Architects/Engineers

1. All State Department of Administrative Services procedures, including advertising and determination of firms selected for interview, will be followed.
2. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ Ohio Facilities Construction Commission (OFCC) will interview the firms recommended for consideration. In addition to the President and Executive Vice President, the Committee may invite others to participate in the process.
3. The Finance and Facilities Committee and representative(s) of the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ OFCC will follow the procedures established by the ~~Office of the State Architect~~ OFCC to select the architect/engineer for the project.
4. The Committee, for informational purposes, will report the selection to the Board of Trustees.

Classification Four (4). Alternative Project Delivery Methods

On a case-by-case basis, the administration may designate a capital project for construction using the “design-build” delivery method. The University administration will select the design-build firm and will inform the Board of Trustees at their next regularly scheduled meeting.

The University will follow the guidelines for this alternative delivery method as established by the OFCC.

YSU CONSTRUCTION PROJECTS UPDATE – NOVEMBER 7, 2012

Academic Building Renovations Project – The first phase of the Academic Building Project is complete and included renovations to the auditoriums in Cushwa Hall, DeBartolo Hall, Moser Hall and Ward Beecher. An additional auditorium in Beeghly Center will be renovated the summer of 2013. Design work is by Facilities and Media and Academic Computing staff.

Following this initial project will be general renovation projects in Cushwa Hall and DeBartolo Hall. The renovations will include but not be limited to flooring, lighting, wall finishes, major mechanical system upgrades and building exterior repairs. This project will begin the summer of 2013 and be complete in time for fall classes.

M1 Parking Deck Repairs – We will continue with preventative maintenance during the summer of 2013 on the M1 parking deck to ensure its long term viability. Bid documents will be developed over this winter and the project will bid in the spring of 2013.

Chilled Water Storage Deck Repairs – The Chilled Water Storage Tank is located just east of the Central Utility Plant and has a concrete deck on top of it that is used for parking. The deck has deteriorated and is in need of repairs. As part of the deck repairs for 2013, this area will be addressed.

Athletic Fields West of Fifth – This project has begun and is well underway. All base-bid items and alternate items were accepted and include a synthetic soccer field, all weather track, softball field, fencing and lighting for the soccer field, and fencing around the entire site. Additional items will also be added and are currently under design by our associate GPD Group. These items include a restroom/concession facility, track and softball stands, softball dugouts with scorer's box and pitcher's warm-up area, lighting for the softball field, walkways and general site lighting.

It is anticipated that the base-bid items will be complete by April 2013 weather permitting with the additional items and complete build-out being finished by late summer 2013.

Campus Elevators Upgrades – This initial project is complete. It consisted of complete renovations to the Kilcawley House elevator and both Cushwa Hall south elevators. The next phase of this project will consist of the Cushwa Hall north elevators and the mid-floor elevator in Maag Library. There will also be evaluations of the elevators across campus with additional work taking place late summer 2013 or summer 2014.

Bliss Hall Music Practice Rooms – Originally constructed in the 1970's, the practice rooms in Bliss Hall are small spaces constructed of hard materials that reverberate sounds within the rooms and project the sounds into the surround spaces causing disruptions in the corridors and adjacent instructional spaces. This project will address the acoustics within the rooms and also reduce the sound infiltration into adjacent spaces.

Construction started in late May 2012 and substantial completion concluded prior to the start of fall classes. Some long lead items such as acoustic doors, acoustical wall treatments and other miscellaneous items will be completed over winter break this December and January.

Wind Turbine Project – Working with CJL Engineering and the department of Mechanical Engineering Technology with funding through a Department of Energy grant, Facilities is assisting with the installation of wind turbines behind Melnick Hall and along the East Bound Service Road. Three wind turbines will be installed on 80' towers and data from these turbines will be collected and studied by the Engineering Technology department.

This project was competitively bid with Zenith Systems being the low bidder. This project is on hold while the Department of Energy evaluates the location of the turbines and their proximity to a historic district along Wick Avenue. We will know more about the construction start and completion dates once they have made their determination.

Basketball/Olympic Sports Weight Room – This project will be the construction of a weight room on the long deck in Beeghly Center that will be used by the basketball team and by members of Olympic sports teams. Construction is scheduled to begin December 2012 and conclude in March 2013.

Melnick Hall Renovations – Preliminary work is beginning on renovation plans to Melnick Hall. Currently the Journalism program, WYSU, Jambar, Rookery Radio and parts of Telecommunications will occupy the building. We have requested \$2.5million in our capital request specifically earmarked for Melnick with additional funds coming from bond proceeds for a total project of \$4.5M.

Strollo Architects was chosen as the design consultant and a contract is being developed. Once Strollo is under contract, design work will begin.

Pilgrim Church – Work is underway by Facilities staff to develop drawings and specifications for the demolition of this building. Some stained glass windows have already been removed and efforts are underway to find homes for the remaining windows. Demolition is anticipated over winter break.

Building System Upgrades; 4160v Loop Repair – YSU has its own sub-station where power is brought on to campus and distributed out to our buildings. Most of our buildings are fed off of a "loop" from the sub-station which provides a redundant source of power so that in the event of one part of the loop failing, the other part of the loop can continue to supply power. As part of the Campus Wide Building System Upgrades project, major building systems such as voltage loops, steam lines and HVAC systems will be upgraded or replaced helping to ensure little to no disruption in service to our campus community.

In this project, a critical portion of a damaged power loop from our sub-station to our student dorms will be replaced. Replacing this line will ensure a redundant, reliable supply of power to our student housing.

This project was competitively bid and B&J Electric was the low bidder. This project has started and should be complete by early 2013.

Veterans Affairs – Located on the former site of the Peck House, a new building will be constructed to house Veterans Affairs. Through recent construction reform, new project delivery methods are available to use and for this project, we will use design-build. Design build is a construction method where by a specification, or criteria, is developed that details what the building is, how it should look, the types and size of spaces, etc. and then design-build contractors use this criteria to develop their proposal. Using this method will generally speed up the process and get the project started earlier than using traditional design-bid-build methods. We are anticipating this project to start early summer of 2013 and be complete by early 2014.

YSU Capital Construction Update

1/31/2012

Project	Cost	Est. Const. Start	Completion	Funding Source				
				Bonds	Gifts	Capital	YSU Local	Kilcawley
Veterans Affairs	\$225,000	January 2012	May 2012		X			X
Phelps Building Roof	\$200,000	October 2011	December 2011					X
Lincoln Building Roof	\$250,000	April 2012	July 2012					X
M2 Deck Renovations Phase 2	\$950,000	May 2012	August 2012	X				
M1 Deck Renovations	\$300,000	May 2012	August 2012				X	
Campus Tunnel Renovations	\$400,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Pollock House	\$3,000,000	September 2011	June 2012	X	X			
Elevators: Kilcawley House	\$200,000	May 2012	August 2012				X	
Cushwa Hall South	\$450,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Bliss Hall Practice Rooms	\$350,000	May 2012	August 2012			X		
Auditoriums	\$2,500,000							X
Cushwa Hall		May 2012	August 2012					
Ward Beecher		May 2012	August 2012					
DeBartolo Hall		May 2012	August 2012					
Beeghly Center 104		May 2012	August 2012					
Cushwa/Debartolo Entryways	\$350,000	Dec 2012	January 2013					X
Athletic Fields West of Fifth	\$1,875,000	April 2012	August 2012	X				
Total	\$11,050,000							

Bonds Funds from the sale of bonds
 Gifts Funds from gifts to the university
 Capital State capital (reappropriated basic renovation) funds
 YSU Local Funds from auxiliaries
 Kilcawley Funds transferred from the Kilcawley Center project

Project	Cost	Est. Const. Start	Completion	Funding Source				
				Bonds	Gifts	Capital	YSU Local	Kilcawley
Veterans Affairs	\$1,250,000	August 2013	April 2014		X			X
Campus Core Lighting*	\$495,000	June 2013	August 2013			X		
Concrete Replacement	\$500,000	June 2013	August 2013			X		
Melnick Hall Renovation	\$4,500,000	June 2013	March 2014		X	X		X
Academic Building Phase II	\$4,450,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		X
Campus Tunnel Renovations*	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Campus Roof Renovations		TBD	TBD			X		
Elevators: I Maag Library	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Cushwa Hall North	\$500,000	May 2013	August 2013			X		
Wind Turbines	\$125,000	TBD	TBD				Grant	
M1 Parking Deck/Chilled Water Lot	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013				X	
4160v Project	\$250,000	September 2012	January 2013			X		
Dental Hygiene Lab Renovations	\$200,000	December 2012	February 2013		X			
Tennis/Golf Locker Rooms	\$175,000	December 2012	February 2013				X	
Beeghly Center Auditorium	\$400,000	May 2013	August 2013					X
Basketball/Olympic Sports Weight Room	\$127,000	December 2012	March 2013				X	
Beeghly Center HPE Addition##	\$200,000	April 2013	August 2013				X	
Pilgram Church Demo	\$75,000	December 2012	January 2013				X	
Athletic Fields West of Fifth	\$4,350,000	September 2012	August 2013	X				X
Total	\$18,797,000							

- Bonds Funds from the sale of bonds
- Gifts Funds from gifts to the university
- Capital State capital (reappropriated basic renovation) funds
- YSU Local Funds from auxiliaries
- Kilcawley Funds transferred from the Kilcawley Center project

Timeline based on starting in November 2012

*Tentative project, will be complete if time permits