Youngstown
STATE UNIVERSITY

BOARD OF TRUSTEES
AUDIT SUBCOMMITTEE
Leonard D. Schiavone, Chair
Harry Meshel, Vice Chair
Charles R. Bush
Bryce A. Miner
Carole S. Weimer, *Ex-Officio*
James P. Tressel, *Ex-Officio*

Tuesday, March 15, 2016	**Tod Hall**
1:00 p.m. or immediately following	**Board Meeting Room**
previous meeting	

AGENDA

A. **Disposition of Minutes for Meeting Held December 3, 2015**

B. **Old Business**

C. **Subcommittee Item**

    1. Discussion Items

        a. Strategic Plan Cornerstone Dashboard Update   **Tab 1**
        A report on the Regional Engagement Cornerstone will be given by
        Shannon Tirone, Associate Vice President for University Relations, and
        Sylvia Imler, Executive Director for Multicultural Affairs and Interim Associate
        Provost for International and Global Initiatives.

        b. Audits Timeline Matrix   **Tab 2**
        This matrix tracks the progress of the implementation of recommendations for
        improvement or correction made by internal and external auditors.
        Packer Thomas will report.

        c. Internal Audit Report on Banner Access for Transferred Employees   **Tab 3**
        Packer Thomas will report.

D. **New Business**

E. **Adjournment**

YSU 2020 Strategic Plan Update: Regional Engagement Cornerstone

The Regional Engagement Cornerstone of the YSU 2020 Strategic Plan refers to activities that enhance the quality of life, well-being, and economic development of communities in and around Youngstown and the surrounding region.

THEME	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013	2013-2014	2014-2015
Theme 1: Value to Business, Industry & Non Profit Organization Number of community activities /projects	164	N/A	N/A	N/A	170[1]
Theme 2: Artistic Cultural Engagement Number of attendees at cultural events	N/A	33,500	36,000	N/A	N/A (See Campus Tracking)
Number of programs that broaden diversity	N/A	N/A	N/A	91[2]	91+[3]
Theme 3: Health/ Wellness Number of students completing health and human services internships	1,180	1183[4]	1,178	1,292	1302
Number of Students passing certification or licensing exams	91.8%	97%*	95.6%*	96*	95%
Theme 4: Intercollegiate Athletics Athletic events/clinics/camps (Number participating)	2,033	2,327	2,465	2,483	2,987
Athletic service events/outreach. (Number of patrons)	111 (14,290)	105 (14,811)	100 (10,802)	118 (24,798)	163 (20,388)

	Campus Tracking 2014-2015	Campus Tracking 2015-2016 (to date)
Admissions		3,407
Alumni / Pete's Pride		1,360
Athletics		183,394
BCOE		478
Bookstore		9,600
Campus Rec		9,830
Career Services		326
CCAC		6,189
CLASS		2,465
College in High School		2,623
DeBartolo Stadium Club		620
Diversity & Multicultural Affairs		4
Events		16,410
Financial Aid		2,475
Graduate Studies		9
Honors College		386
Housing & Resident Life		
Kilcawley		6,371
Marketing Office		30
McDonough		954
Orientation Services		590
Police		102
Pollock House		1,321
Provost		78
ROTC		
STEM		10,879
Student Activities		266
Student Diversity		2,128
Upward Bound		255
Veterans Resource Center		393
WCBA		4,465
WYSU		724
Wellness		1,427
TOTAL	**534,123**	**335,715**

[1] Business and industry research activities/projects

[2] Does not represent all university programs that broaden diversity. Data derived from all colleges and Student Affairs and submitted as the Diversity Programming Spring 2014 Report to Office of Diversity & Multicultural Affairs.

[3] 2014-2015 academic year reflects the minimum number of events from the Spring 2014 academic report. Colleges and respective programs/studies continued with similar programs.

[4] 2011-2012 data are close estimates provided by HHS Chairpersons and Dean.
*Percentages for certification/licensure passage rates are averages provided by HHS Dean.

Note: A clearinghouse is needed to collect data from respective colleges and/or programs each semester for accountability and more accurate reporting.

To summarize, the Board Metrics are
Business/NPO Value: Number of community-engagement activities/projects
Artistic/Cultural Engagement: Index of no. of attendees + no. of programs that broaden demographic diversity
Health and Wellness: Number of students completing internships in health and human services, Percentage of students and graduates passing discipline-related certification/licensing exams
Athletics: Numbers of individuals attending athletic events and clinics
Number of service events completed by student-athletes and staff

The 41 recommendations at February 12, 2016 are from 2 external auditor management letters and
11 Packer Thomas (PT) internal audits. This compares to 33 recommendations at November 12, 2015.

Audit Name	Total		Critical		Behind		On Schedule		Complete	
	11/12/15	2/12/16	11/12/15	2/12/16	11/12/15	2/12/16	11/12/15	2/12/16	11/12/15	2/12/16
E&Y FY2007 Management Letter	1	1			1	1				
PT Human Resources (Feb 2012)	3	3				1	1		2	2
PT Grants (Jan 2014)	4	4				2	3		1	2
PT Segregation of Duties (April 2014)	4	4			3	4	1			
PT Events Management and Unrelated Business Income Tax (April 2014)	2	2					1		1	2
PT PCard-Analysis of Audit Procedures (Sept 2014)	1	1							1	1
PT Contract Management Specific to Services (Oct 2014)	2	2							2	2
PT Security of Personally Identifiable Information (Nov 2014)	4	4			4			4		
PT Academic Processes (Feb 2015)	5	5		1		1	2		3	3
PT Cash Collections Sites (July 2015)	7	7					7	3		4
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)		5				1		2		2
PT Compliance Audit (Oct 2015)		2								2
Crowe Horwath FY2015 Management Letter		1								1
Totals	**33**	**41**	**0**	**1**	**8**	**10**	**15**	**9**	**10**	**21**

Audits_Timeline_Matrix_2-12-16 Summary

0 deleted, 8 added

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
E&Y Mgt Let FY 2007 (Oct 2007)	01/31/16	The University should review the draft DRP plan to ensure it meets requirements in the event of a disaster. It should be tested to ensure that it functions as intended, includes a continuity strategy based on University priorities, and encompasses all key processes. A Business Impact Analysis (BIA) should be performed to determine the functions that are considered essential to the University's core business operations and the timeframe that these need to be recovered. Annually and when major changes occur to the technology environment, the plan should be reviewed, revised, and tested. [This recommendation was made in prior years.]	Several steps have been taken to address this repeated language to prepare the campus to move forward with the disaster recovery initiative. It is estimated that a complete and verifiable Banner-specific disaster recovery strategy will be delivered within 6-12 months following the implementation of the SCT Banner systems. In preparation for the Banner specific disaster recovery initiative, a service level agreement with Ohio State University to serve as YSU's disaster recovery site has been completed. Hardware was purchased to establish connectivity with Ohio State University. YSU personnel traveled to Columbus to install the hardware and have begun testing connectivity to YSU.	*(yellow)*	*(yellow)*	The DR rack has been ordered and will be tested locally before remote deployment. An MOU with the University of Akron is under development for reciprocal hosting of DR racks. **Deadline revised to September 30, 2016.**
PT Human Resources (Feb 2012)	09/30/15	The University should develop policies to govern the use of social networking profiles during the hiring process, consider hiring a third party to filter protected-class information from profiles prior to review of them by the University and disclose to employment candidates that a search of their social networking profile may be conducted.	We are conducting research to identify appropriate issues and language to utilize in the formulation of a policy and have also reached out to the IUC schools to identify if they currently have a social networking in hiring policy.			HR has developed two statements: one for the search committees and one for the applicants. For the search committee, it will advise against reviewing any applicants social networking profiles to avoid any outside influence or discriminatory animus being interjected into the process at the initial candidate review stage. The statement to the applicant will simply warn them that their social networking profiles may be viewed as part of the job application and reference checking process. The University will not be acting upon the recommendation to hire a third party to filter protected-class information from profiles prior to review of them.
PT Human Resources (Feb 2012)	01/31/16	University staff should be reminded of the requirements of University policy as it relates to supplementary payments. The Human Resources department should improve monitoring procedures over the timeliness of approvals and limitations on amounts of supplementary payments.	The existing supplemental pay policy is being revised to address the concerns expressed in the audit. Forms are being revised to correspond to the revised policy. Training will coincide with the revised processes and forms. The Manager, HRIS is charged with responsibility of exploring way to automate processes.			All Supplemental pay policies are being brought to the Board for approval in the December 2015 meetings. The HR staff/Research Office staff have re-defined the use of supplemental pay and will be announcing new forms to process payments for all of the situations that were being called "supplemental" pay, but in reality were not. Training will be provided.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)	

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Human Resources (Feb 2012)	01/31/16	The Department of Human Resources should be responsible for processing all new hires and should orient all new employees to help ensure that University policies and procedures are properly communicated to new employees.	We agree that all newly hired University employees with the exception of student employees should be processed by Human Resources. The Manager, HRIS will be charged with researching ways to initiate and implement workflows to expedite the hiring process. Human Resources will collaborate with the Provost's Office to formulate and implement a part-time Faculty orientation program.			Parallel testing through PeopleAdmin continues. After testing is complete, a paperless hiring process will be rolled out. Part-time faculty orientation has been implemented. **Deadline revised to July 31, 2016.**
PT Grants (Jan 2014)	12/31/15	The University should explore different alternatives to help increase the number and amount of grants received.	OGSP plays only a small role in providing incentives for faculty and staff to seek external grants. The primary incentive must come from the vision, goals, and policies established by the University Board of Trustees and administration. First, the faculty must realize that pursuit of external funding is essential in promotion and tenure decisions, and they must be given adequate release time for grant writing. Next, for senior faculty, University policies must reward continued scholarship and grant seeking. To this end, the Board of Trustees Policy 7023.02 on Supplemental Pay from Grants should be reviewed, and revised if possible and the idea of merit pay rewards should be revisited. Adding a grants coordinator in OGSP can contribute to growth by helping PI's to identify more funding opportunities, and by improved assistance in proposal submission and post-award guidance.			Board Policy 3356-7-48 *Supplemental pay from grants and sponsored programs for faculty and professional / administrative staff* (Formerly 7023.03) has been reviewed and rewritten, and will be presented to the Board of Trustees in December. No provisions have been made in this revised Policy for merit pay rewards, though that possibility was considered. The Office of Research includes an AVP for Research, Director of Grants and Sponsored programs, a Grants Coordinator, and an Administrative Assistant. Though titles have changed, no additional resources have yet been added to the department. Additional resources would enable better level of support for faculty and help ensure audit compliance. This team is helping PI's identify more funding opportunities, and is providing assistance in proposal submission and post-award guidance. Proposal submissions for FY 2016 to date are at a pace that will double submissions during FY 15.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)	

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Grants (Jan 2014)	12/31/15	A more formal review of the duties assigned to the Office of Grants and Sponsored Programs department should be made in order to determine whether appropriate tasks are being performed by the appropriate persons.	A request has been initiated to start a new search for a grants coordinator. One of the main goals with this position is to provide better education and service to PI's by increasing outreach efforts including grant submission procedures, budgeting, etc. A search is underway for a new Associate Provost and Dean of Graduate Studies and Research. This individual will restore continuity to supervision of the OGSP. A formal review of duties will be performed at that time.			The Director of Grants and Sponsored Programs and the AVP for Research have completed a review of assigned duties to determine task appropriateness. Going forward, the Office of Research hopes to extend this review of assigned duties to both upstream and downstream organizations to ensure smooth transition from faculty to pre-award to post-award processing. Thus far, two training sessions have been held for all faculty; multiple research training meetings have been held in every college and many departments, as well as with several individual faculty members. The Grants website is now updated, with all essential Grants Office forms updated and web-enabled. New business processes have been defined so as to expedite and clarify grants management processes. Four Board Policies related to Grants have been updated with the Board of Trustees in December.
PT Grants (Jan 2014)	12/31/15	Currently, all accounting and operating functions are conducted by one individual. At a minimum, the bank statement should be reconciled by someone other than the sole YSURF staff and invoices should be approved by the YSURF staff's supervisor.	The YSURF President will bring the recommendation to the attention of the YSURF Board and will provide a follow-up response to the University.			All YSURF documents (including the YSURF Code of Regulations) have been reviewed, and a detailed step-by-step strategy has been outlined to re-constitute the YSURF Board (largely vacant due to attrition) and enhance structure and effectiveness of YSURF through staff additions and changes, procedural enhancements, clear visioning of YSURF role and purpose, and marketing of YSURF services and process. YSURF Board will convene within the next quarter to amend the Code of Regulations , select a new slate of officers, and launch the reconstituted YSURF. Addressing this issue will be a high priority that could be addressed by staffing of vacant positions and/or the naming of all YSURF officers. **Deadline revised to June 30, 2016.**

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Grants (Jan 2014)	12/31/15	We suggest that management consider developing a specific strategic direction for the YSURF and communicating it to employees.	The YSURF President and Board will work with University leadership (President, Provost, and Associate Provost and Dean of Graduate Studies and Research) to clarify the strategic direction and operation of YSURF.			Pending restructuring of the YSURF Board and election of new officers, establishing and documenting the YSURF specific strategic direction and communicating it broadly will be a high priority. **Deadline revised to June 30, 2016**
PT Segregation of Duties (April 2014)	12/31/16	There is a lack of segregation of duties for manual payroll time entries. There are employees who have the ability to enter manual time entries without additional approval or verification. This lack of segregation of duties increases the risk that incorrect or fraudulent paychecks may be issued. Manual time entries should be tracked and an individual should be assigned to confirm the validity of all manual time entries. This individual should not have access to create a manual time entry.	The Payroll Department, based on approved source documentation, is responsible to enter hours/time for the minority of hourly timesheets that were not electronically processed through self-service Banner. As a compensating control, a report will be developed to identify any hours manually entered. This report will be compared to the source documents by a different individual than the individual entering from the source document. Also, the Banner HR/Payroll security role classes were reviewed and the number of individuals with both duties has been reduced and segregated.			System constraints include lack of a two-step process for processing payroll adjustments after the supervisor approval and lack of an audit trail for any changes made after the supervisor approval. Banner XE includes enhancements that are anticipated to reduce risk of improper adjustments being made without detection. However, due to unanticipated factors, including employee turnover and competing priorities in the IT area, this upgrade is currently not scheduled to be implemented until at the earliest the second quarter of 2017. Some compensating controls currently in place include the distribution of personnel reports after each pay to the Financial Managers, audit reports generated from the system to identify irregularities, and external audit procedures performed on payroll. **Deadline revised to Sept 30, 2017**

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule	Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Segregation of Duties (April 2014)	12/31/16	There are 4 individuals with the ability to process/calculate payroll. Of these individuals, they all have ability to generate paychecks and add/approve hours, and 3 have access to record payroll in the general ledger and the ability to make general ledger entries. This lack of segregation within the process of generating the payroll creates and increases risk of error or fraud within a paycheck or payroll. We recommend a review of the workflow steps from running (calculating) the payroll through the financial recording of the payroll and reassign rights in the system to maximize segregation of duties.	Security access has been redesigned to limit the ability to perform the above workflow to only the Associate Controller. These functions are necessary for the Associate Controller in order to supervise the Payroll Department as well as the general accounting functions in the Controller's Office. However, any manual entry of hours by the Associate Controller will be reviewed in the audit report mentioned in Management's Response to Audit Finding & Recommendation #2. The security access for all of the other individuals mentioned has been segregated between entering, processing payroll, generating checks, and posting to the ledger.			System constraints include lack of a two-step process for processing payroll adjustments after the supervisor approval and lack of an audit trail for any changes made after the supervisor approval. Banner XE includes enhancements that are anticipated to reduce risk of improper adjustments being made without detection. However, due to unanticipated factors, including employee turnover and competing priorities in the IT area, this upgrade is currently not scheduled to be implemented until at the earliest the second quarter of 2017. Some compensating controls currently in place include the distribution of personnel reports after each pay to the Financial Managers, audit reports generated from the system to identify irregularities, and external audit procedures performed on payroll. **Deadline revised to Sept 30, 2017**
PT Segregation of Duties (April 2014)	12/31/16	There is a lack of segregation of duties with the manual (off-cycle) check process. There are individuals who can print manual checks and who have access to the check stock. An individual who has the ability to generate a manual (off-cycle) check should not have access to the check stock.	In order to segregate duties, the individuals who had access to the blank check stock no longer have the ability to initiate a manual check except for one person. As a compensating control, any manual entry of hours by that person will be reviewed in the audit report mentioned in Management's Response to Audit Finding & Recommendation #2.			System constraints include lack of a two-step process for processing payroll adjustments after the supervisor approval and lack of an audit trail for any changes made after the supervisor approval. Banner XE includes enhancements that are anticipated to reduce risk of improper adjustments being made without detection. However, due to unanticipated factors, including employee turnover and competing priorities in the IT area, this upgrade is currently not scheduled to be implemented until at the earliest the second quarter of 2017. Some compensating controls currently in place include the distribution of personnel reports after each pay to the Financial Managers, audit reports generated from the system to identify irregularities, and external audit procedures performed on payroll. **Deadline revised to Sept 30, 2017**

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Segregation of Duties (April 2014)	01/31/16	There is a lack of segregation of duties within the process of entering and/or modifying the permanent employee file, which includes payroll and benefit information. This increases the risk of errors or fraudulent activity regarding the set up and payment of an employee. We recommend that an individual be assigned to verify that all additions and changes to the employee master file are authorized. This individual should not have access to make entries into the employee master file.	The Employee Processing Center (EPC) in the Human Resource (HR) department is responsible to enter employee information into the Banner employee master file based on approved source documentation. The Banner system cannot separate the ability to update the master file and the ability to approve changes to the master file, nor is it feasible to have and employee review all changes. HR is however in the process of implementing an electronic workflow to segregate these functions with expected implementation commencing December 2014. Currently, as a compensating control in addition to the new hire report, the EPC Manager will continue to review exception reports to identify irregularities and incomplete data. In addition, the number of employees with access to the master file has been reduced.			Continue running parallel testing through Banner EPAF (electronic personnel actions forms). EPAF's have a two step process for approval and application prior to loading into Banner master file. **Deadline revised to September 30, 2016.**
PT Events Management and UBIT (April 2014)	10/31/15	The events management process varies across the campus. This creates confusion and increases risks to the University. We recommend that policies and procedures relating to the entire events management process and the rental of University facilities be developed and consistently applied.	The campus events team is currently reviewing, with legal's guidance, the current YSU Guidebook policy 4003.01 University Facilities-Use, Priorities and Fees. This policy is severely outdated and is up for review in 2015. With a total revision to match today's practices and developing standards, a new policy will be an effective tool in establishing consistency and better customer service. Also, when the campus events team reviews this policy, we plan to pay special attention to student groups and campus departments that have fronted in the past for off campus groups or organizations to hold their events using university facilities, and decide if this is a practice that we plan to allow to continue.			Policy 4003.01, Facilities Fees, Use and Priorities, was approved by the Board of Trustees and the updated version has been added to the guide book. It is in effect for all of campus to use.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Events Management and UBIT (April 2014)	12/31/15	We noted that important records, including signed contracts, proof of liability insurance, and liquor permits count not be located when requested. The causes of the problem appeared to be the lack of a clearly specified and organized system for record storage and retention. This disorganization increases the risk that these records will not be located in the event they are needed to settle a claim or dispute. We recommend the following steps be taken: Decide on a systematic manner of filing documents and establish a policy specifying which records should be retained permanently and which records should be kept only for a given period.	Departments will work together to establish a policy for recordkeeping following the guidelines listed in "Records Retention for Public Colleges and Universities in Ohio". Departments will determine where to store each type of document (contracts, liquor permits, etc.) and for how long. Some departments are currently scanning documents for storage and utilizing shared drives for open department access to certain documents. Currently, room reservations are kept indefinitely in the system. Other options will be explored for better organization of and quicker access to documents for personnel involved in event planning/scheduling.			Policy 3356-9-09 was distributed at all-campus events in January, 2016. Policy can be found here: http://cms.ysu.edu/administrative-offices/university-policies/9-administration-and-personnel. All parties have agreed to initiate in their event-planning process, evaluation and documentation.
PT PCard - Analysis of Audit Procedures (Sept 2014)	12/31/15	We recommend using system parameters wherever possible in an effort to help eliminate the need of reviewing 100% of procurement card transactions.	Procurement Services is currently in the process of reviewing the policy monitoring tools offered by JP Morgan Chase. The policy monitoring tools will facilitate monitoring of high risk transactions not controlled through the use of MCCs. Implementation of the policy monitoring tool is expected by December 31, 2014. The audit procedures performed by the Controller's Office will be revised as part of that implementation.			Utilization of the Chase policy monitoring tools has been in place since mid March. Merchant Commodity Code groups have been reviewed and revised. Audit procedures have been modified accordingly.
PT Contract Management Specific to Services (October 2014)	09/30/15	Upon review of the contract with RefPay, we discovered that the University has agreed to indemnify and hold harmless the RefPay. According to the contract compliance administration guide, the University is prohibited from indemnifying or holding harmless the other party in the contract. We suggest that this contract be reviewed by the Legal Department to determine the proper resolution.	The contract with RefPay is an on-line click through agreement. Procurement Services will work with Athletics to seek a written agreement with RefPay to address mutual acceptance of terms.			A contract addendum has been completed.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Contract Management Specific to Services (October 2014)	10/31/15	There is no evidence that the University has a process in place to perform due diligence prior to contract execution to verify that a vendor has effective internal controls surrounding data confidentiality and security, when applicable. We recommend implementing a procedure to obtain and review Service Organization control Reports (SOC) to evaluate the suitability of the design and operating effectiveness of a service organization's internal controls relative to the service being provided.	A procedure will be implemented to require that service organizations provide a SOC report prior to contract execution and that periodic SOC reports are provided throughout the contract period. Agreement templates for the Standard Independent Contractor Agreement (SICA) and the Professional Service Agreement (PSA) will be updated to incorporate language to require SOC reports when appropriate. In addition, as part of Contract Administration, a procedure will be implemented to ensure that the University sponsor of the agreement has a procedure in place to obtain, review and file SOC reports with Procurement Services. An inventory of existing goods and service contracts will be performed to identify contracts which may be subject to SOC reports and efforts made to obtain and review such reports.			The PSA agreement and contract administration procedures were updated July 2015 to incorporate the SOC language (it was determined that the SICA agreement did not need modified). An inventory of existing contracts has been performed and provided to IT to determine applicability.
PT Security of Personally Identifiable Information (November 2014)	07/31/16	As part of the risk assessment process, the data classification policy in the University's "Sensitive Information Policy should be implemented. Highly sensitive PII data should be located in the processes and data system and evaluated for additional cybersecurity protection measures.	Network and Data security is in the process of evaluating areas known to utilize PII as well as the storage and accessibility of such data on a department by department basis.	Behind but manageable	On schedule	The new Information Security Officer has been hired. One of his goals this year is to develop a plan for this project.
PT Security of Personally Identifiable Information (November 2014)	07/31/16	Audit logs are not routinely reviewed for potential security incidents or breaches. The University should consider using tools to create automatic reports from system activity logs that would identify system anomalies. These exception reports would be sent to IT personnel for investigation and timely follow up.	The University agrees. However, ITS must first implement a central log file repository and retain system logs for a consistent length of time. Once that is achieved, routine scanning of all logs will be explored. Packages that exist for this purpose will be evaluated at that time.	Behind but manageable	On schedule	The new Information Security Officer has been hired. One of his goals this year is to develop a plan for this project.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Security of Personally Identifiable Information (November 2014)	07/31/16	A list of authorized hardware and software should be complied. The University should employ scanning tools that will periodically scan the network for unauthorized software and devices and create action alerts.	YSU has deployed the Altiris Desktop management system. Not only does it push software, it inventories almost all software packages installed by users with administrator accounts. In addition, Altiris inventories authorized hardware connected to the wired network. YSU is exploring solutions that will identify and send an alert when unauthorized hardware is connected to the wired network.	*(yellow)*	*(green)*	The new Information Security Officer has been hired. One of his goals this year is to develop a plan for this project.
PT Security of Personally Identifiable Information (November 2014)	07/31/16	The University could configure the system to prohibit the copying of sensitive data onto USB drives, once the highly sensitive data has been identified in the system. In the event that there is a legitimate business need to use a USB drive, the University could configure the system to encrypt sensitive data when copied, or supply selected employees with hardware encrypted USB flash drives for use when copying PII.	The University will review its policies & procedures with regard to extracting PII to any mobile media or local storage in light of improved access restrictions being implemented. This review will include consideration of scanning local storage for PII as we believe PII stored locally poses a more significant security threat than mobile storage.	*(yellow)*	*(green)*	The new Information Security Officer has been hired. One of his goals this year is to develop a plan for this project.
PT Academic Processes (February 2015)		We recommend that the revenue/cost system be completed and implemented and used as a tool to analyze financial data at lower levels. In addition, consideration should be given to participating in the National Study of Instructional Costs and Productivity ("Delaware Cost Study").	YSU has begun participating in the Delaware study. We recommend that the IT financial project be placed on hold while we review the information obtained through our participation in the Delaware Study.			The Delaware study will be used as the financial basis and the IT financial project discontinued.
PT Academic Processes (February 2015)		We recommend that the University implement a thorough academic program review process wherein all programs are reviewed on a cyclical basis.	Currently, YSU has requested that each program complete a program improvement plan which was required and received by the end of March 2015. These plans, in conjunction with participation in the Delaware Study, will form the basis on which to implement a program review process that will begin in the 2015-16 academic year.			Program review is now underway. First materials are due by mid-February.

Audits_Timeline_Matrix_2-12-16

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule	Completed (will be deleted from next report)	

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Academic Processes (February 2015)		We recommend the University review the number and levels of Administrative Assistants in conjunction with other factors that are pertinent to each college to determine that the number of Administrative Assistants within each college meets the needs and objectives of each college and to determine where shared resources can be utilized.	Our participation in the Delaware Study will provide some benchmark data to determine how YSU staffing compares to other University's within our peer group. After obtaining that information, we will use it as a component of our program review process to determine where adjustments to staffing levels are required.			This recommendation is a low level of concern and is therefore not being implemented.
PT Academic Processes (February 2015)	06/30/16	We recommend that part time faculty contracts be electronically generated through the Human Resource system, and the contract routed electronically to the applicable people for electronic signature.	Human resources personnel are working to implement PeopleAdmin for generating part-time faculty contracts. This process is not simple as it requires the integration of two separate tracking systems; on to pull data from the personnel system and the other to integrate with the student registration system.	On schedule	Behind but manageable	Parallel testing through PeopleAdmin continues. After testing is complete, a paperless hiring process will be rolled out. Part-time faculty orientation has been implemented. **Deadline revised to July 31, 2016.**
PT Academic Processes (February 2015)	12/31/16	We recommend that further research be done to determine if the Banner System has the capability to calculate and track teaching hours, non-teaching time, and total faculty workload, and if the system does, then the use of the system should be implemented.	Banner has the ability to monitor faculty workload, and there is faculty workload non-teaching capability. A more detailed analysis of Banner system capabilities should be completed. The academic division is currently working with the Registrar's office to implement a full year scheduling and registration system; this system will make much of the data available at an earlier time and improve tracking and reporting processes.	On schedule	Critical delay	We continue to await implementation of Banner XE. Implementation cannot occur without this critical system upgrade.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	01/31/16	We recommend that the vault in a collection site be locked during business hours and only be accessible by those individuals with supervisory responsibilities. We also recommend each ticket window cashier be issued a cash drawer at the beginning of their shift that provides them with the ability to make change. Cashiers would also be responsible for reconciling their drawer at the end of their shift to provide adequate internal controls and to timely identify any overages/shortages.	Management agrees and will amend the MOUs to specifically require secure storage of cash at all times.			Bursar met with Collection site and the Audit recommendations were put into place. In addition, the office space is being remodeled so that the space is designed as a cashier window.
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	01/31/16	During surprise cash counts, it was determined that the Director did not have/know the combination to the vault. We recommend the Director have direct access to the vault at the collection site and for the Director to be properly trained on the monitoring process as stated in the MOU.	Management agrees with this recommendation and will communicate this to the Director, her supervisor, and Human Resources so that her job description may be updated, if necessary.			Bursar met with Collection site and the recommendation were put into place.
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	05/31/16	We recommend deposit slip forms be reviewed and possibly modified to include space for a secondary review sign-off. For instance there should be separate sections of the form that read, "Deposit Prepared By" and "Deposit Reviewed By".	Management agrees and will take steps to revise the deposit slip forms accordingly.			The deposit slips were redesigned to include a space for a secondary review and are now available on the Bursar web-site. The Cashier will notify any Department still using the old forms.
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	06/30/16	We recommend incorporating a statement regarding cash overages/shortages similar to that utilized by the University cashier's office into either the "Cash Collection Sites" policy or in the individual MOUs for the collection sites.	The MOUs already include language that any missing cash should immediately be reported to the Bursar; however the MOU's do not address overages. Management agrees that guidance should be given as to what to do with overages and will take steps to update the MOUs accordingly.			Of the 29 Department MOU's, 13 are permitted to use a change fund where they keep a certain amount of money on hand at all times. To date, approximately half of the MOU's have been updated to incorporate guidance regarding overages.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	06/30/16	The MOU for one site contains a mitigating procedure that is designed to overcome the limited segregation of duties associated with collections. The personnel at the clinic however, were not familiar with the procedure, nor had the procedure been performed. We recommend management assist in implementing the control and consider evaluating the adequacy of deposits over the past fiscal year.	Management agrees with this assessment and will assist in implementing this control.	*(green)*	*(green)*	Bursar to meet with Responsible party to implement a change in procedure
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	06/30/16	We recommend all collection sites utilize the services of the University Police to transport deposits. All sites should be equipped with a locked money bag for transportation. If not feasible, then the MOU should be altered for sites that will self transport funds and/or provide for dollar limits.	Management agrees and will incorporate this requirement into all MOUs.	*(green)*	*(white)*	All MOUs have been updated to incorporate guidance regarding utilization of the University Police to transport deposits. The three sites noted in the report that are not currently utilizing Police transport now have language in the MOU that allows for staff transportation under $1000 and over $1000 to utilize University Police. Bursar will monitor to make sure sites are adhering to the requirement.
PT Cash Collection Sites (July 2015)	06/30/16	During audit of one collection site, it was determined that the cash drawers are not being balanced at the end of the cashier's shift, as per the applicable MOU. We recommend all cash drawers be closed and balanced at the end of each cashier shift and evidenced by sign-off by both the cashier and supervisor responsible for verification of the process.	Management agrees.	*(green)*	*(green)*	Bursar to meet with Responsible party to implement a change in procedure
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)	06/30/16	We recommend management consider a swipe card system, similar to that utilized by the University Courtyard apartments, for each of the student housing complexes.	Housing & Residence Life has already identified this as a need and has begun research on products and received preliminary quotes to determine approximate cost of the project. Plans are to move forward by the end of fiscal year 2016.		*(green)*	Associate Director of Housing, Housing Maintenance Supervisor, Campus Locksmith and Director of Facilities met with a contractor to discuss Vanderbilt product to complete the card access project in Housing. We are obtaining current final quotes and hope to move forward by established deadline to have project complete for start of fall semester.

Legend:		Critical delay		Behind but manageable		On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)	01/31/16	We recommend that criminal background checks be performed on all applicants for student housing. Furthermore, management should consider incorporating an application fee to the process to assist in offsetting such cost.	Housing & Residence Life will consider this recommendation. We will research potential vendors and costs associated with enough time to make a final decision for academic year 2016-2017 before the start of fall semester recruitment which begins on February 1, 2016.		(yellow)	Director of Housing & Residence Life has contacted one vendor to inquire about their criminal background services and is in the process of identifying two additional vendors. We have committed to utilizing criminal background checks on all residents and it is only a matter of choosing the vendor. New deadline will be 4/1/16.
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)	01/31/16	All twenty-five applications tested did not contain proof of health insurance as required by the University housing contract. It is recommended that the Office of Housing and Residence Life comply with the policy as set forth in the housing contract, or review its requirements for obtaining such information.	Housing & Residence Life agrees that this policy needs to be clarified. We need to either 1) require students to provide proof of health insurance by uploading a copy of their health insurance card into their application or 2) change the current language to eliminate the need for student to provide proof of health insurance. A final decision will be in place by the start of fall semester recruitment which begins on February 1, 2016.			The requirement of providing Housing & Residence Life with proof of health insurance has been removed from the Housing Contract.
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)	01/31/16	While we understand that lease agreements are based on different types of living arrangements, the University should verify the completeness and consistency of language for all University owned residential contracts. We recommend the legal department review and compare all housing contracts for completeness of required disclosures and consistency of language.	Housing & Residence Life acknowledges the significant differences between the lease used for University Courtyard Apartments, managed by Ambling, and the contract used for University Housing residence halls, manage by YSU. We agree to compare the documents and in conjunction with General Counsel make adjustments which will provide more consistency between them. Any changes to the housing contract will be approved and in place by the start of fall semester recruitment which begins on February 1, 2016.			The housing contract has been reviewed and updated to reflect more consistency with the University Courtyard lease. The housing contract is more comprehensive. General Counsel has signed off on it and it is currently in place.
PT Housing and Residence Life (Oct 2015)	04/30/16	There are a number of housing options listed on the University website which appear to be endorsed by the University, yet not owned or managed by the University. We recommend management consider the feasibility of an affiliation, or referral agreement with the housing options not owned or managed by the Office of Housing and Residence Life.	We agree this could be a potential issue and will move forward with pursuing more formal affiliations with student housing facilities near and adjacent to campus.		(green)	Sample affiliation agreements have been obtained and are currently being adapted for use between YSU and off-campus partners. Final drafts will be completed by 4/1/16.

Legend:		Critical delay			Behind but manageable			On schedule		Completed (will be deleted from next report)	

Audit Name	Deadline	Summary of Recommendation	Summary of Response	Status 11/12/15	Status 2/12/16	Comments
PT Compliance Audit (Oct 2015)		We recommend that the ASFR be reviewed by someone in the legal department for accuracy and to ensure all disclosures required by law are properly included prior to it being published or submitted to the DOE. In addition, the crime and fire statistics presented in the ASFR should be reviewed by an independent person from the preparer to ensure accuracy.	The University shall designate a Clery Act Compliance Officer. This person will receive continuing and inclusive training on the Clery Act.			YSUPD has assigned Officer William Rogner to the position of Clery Compliance Officer. Officer Rogner has extensively reviewed *The Handbook for Campus Safety and Security Reporting*, a federal publication that outlines requirements and guidelines for the Clery Act. Officer Rogner has also completed two NACOOP webinars of a ten part series, covering different aspects of Clery; and he will be attending a Clery seminar in June.
PT Compliance Audit (Oct 2015)		Formal training of Campus Security Authorities (CSAs) regarding the Clery Act has not been performed since November 2012. If someone has significant responsibility for student and campus activities, he or she is a CSA. We recommend that individuals be notified annually of their responsibility as a CSA and annual training should be provided.	The YSUPD will annually identify and notify CSAs as to who they are. The YSUPD will develop and work with the Human Resource department to administer and monitor training,. CSA's are informed in training who they can contact regarding any questions.			Officer Rogner has identified a majority of the Campus Security Authorities, and notified them of their role. The CSA's have completed two of the NACOOP webinars with Officer Rogner. Officer Rogner is currently in the process of developing CSA training and reporting modules utilizing the "BlackBoard" academic platform. The platform can be tethered to The Banner System, therefore allowing Human Resources to monitor training. Officer Rogner has distributed his contact information to the current list of CSAs should they need direction.
Crowe Horwath Mgt Let FY 2015 (Oct 2015)		We recommend management review the policy and procedures governing the withdrawal date used in Return of Title IV Funds calculations. We further recommend documentation be maintained to support withdrawal dates.	Management will review its existing policy and procedures to ensure compliance with federal regulations.			Bursar worked with the Student One Stop who implemented a process whereby the attempted drop date will now be entered in Banner so that Bursar has accurate dates. In addition Student One Stop will use comments and Bursar updated procedures so that staff is required to check comments prior to processing a R2T4.

Youngstown
STATE UNIVERSITY

BANNER ACCESS FOR TRANSFERRED EMPLOYEES INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT

January 27, 2016

PACKER·THOMAS
Certified Public Accountants & Business Consultants
PROVEN TRUE.

YOUNGSTOWN STATE UNIVERSITY

BANNER ACCESS FOR TRANSFERRED EMPLOYEES
INTERNAL AUDIT REPORT

CONTENTS

PACKER · THOMAS
Certified Public Accountants & Business Consultants
PROVEN TRUE.

"In the long run, if you don't put ethics before profits, there won't be a long-run."

Youngstown State University
One University Plaza
Youngstown, Ohio 44555

This report summarizes the results of our internal audit of the University's controls surrounding Banner access privileges for transferred employees. Please review this report. If you have any questions, please call us at (330) 533-9777.

We wish to thank the staff of the human resource, finance and ITS departments for the cooperation that was extended to us during the course of this audit.

Packer Thomas

PACKER THOMAS
January 27, 2016

PACKER · THOMAS
Certified Public Accountants & Business Consultants
PROVEN TRUE.

"In the long run, if you don't put ethics before profits, there won't be a long-run."

3

Youngstown State University

OVERVIEW

An audit of the University's controls surrounding Banner access priveleges for employees transferred within the University was recently completed by Packer Thomas. Our procedures were performed as a result of the internal audit risk assessment which was approved by the Audit Subcommittee.

The objective of our audit was to obtain and document the process for reviewing and implementing Banner system access rights for employees who transferred positions within the University in order to determine the adequacy of the internal controls regarding segregation of duties and authorized access.

Segregation of duties is one of the key concepts of internal controls and also one of the most effective internal controls in combating employee fraud. Segregation of duties contributes to an organization's system of checks and balances. The concept of segregation of duties is to separate key responsibilities within each business process so that, ideally, no individual employee should handle more than one of the key functions in a process. When an organization separates these functions among its employees, it has implemented a strong internal control, which may deter and prevent employee fraud. When an employee transfers departments and system access is not properly modified to reflect only the access needed for the current job, there is a risk of violation of segregation of duties. In addition, best practice is to grant individuals only those system privileges needed to perform his or her job duties. If appropriate access is not properly maintained then an employee may have access to sensitive information that is not required in order to perform their job. It is important that access reviews are performed effectively when an employee transfers internally within the University.

Our consideration of internal controls involved assessing the effectiveness and existence of Banner access reviews and modifications when an employee changes departments within the University.

The procedures performed during our internal audit included interviews with personnel of the human resource, finance, and ITS department, and reviews of system data. It should be noted that our review of Banner access rights with regards to transferred employees would not necessarily identify all deficiencies or inefficiencies. However, we listed a summary of our review.

PACKER·THOMAS
Certified Public Accountants & Business Consultants
PROVEN TRUE.

"In the long run, if you don't put ethics before profits,
there won't be a long-run."

4

PROCEDURES PERFORMED AND RESULTS:

We interviewed key personnel from Human Resources, Finance, and Information Technology Services and determined that the University has a procedure to review and modify Banner access rights when an employee transfers departments within the University. Both the former manager and the new manager review the individual's assigned Banner system access rights. If a change (addition, modification, deletion) is needed in order to reflect the appropriate access for the new job role, either or both managers submit a 'Banner Security Application' form to the Information Technology Services (ITS) department, who makes the requested changes to access rights. We reviewed a list of transferred employees and a sample of Banner access forms and noted that the forms are submitted by the manager to ITS. The forms include a detailed description of the requested Banner roles and must be signed by the manager.

In addition, the ITS department performs a semi-annual audit of Banner access rights. Each department manager is responsible to review a report listing the Banner access assigned to each of his/her employees. Each manager is required to submit a response back to ITS either approving the list or requesting specific access changes. The results of the reviews are stored with the ITS department. We examined documentation of the last semi- annual review and found no issues with this procedure. By assigning each employee to a manager with regard to Banner access, and periodically mandating a review, the University is reducing the risk of unauthorized Banner system access and/or a lack of segregation of duties for transferred employees.

We requested and reviewed a list of employees transferred within the period January 1, 2015 to August 30, 2015 and noted no potential segregation of duties or unauthorized access to sensitive data risks from any employee transferring out of a high privileged access job role to a lower access privileged job role.

As a result of our procedures, we have no findings or recommendations for improvement in this process.

PACKER·THOMAS

Certified Public Accountants & Business Consultants
PROVEN TRUE.

"In the long run, if you don't put ethics before profits, there won't be a long-run."

5